

# MINUTES

CITY OF FLAGSTAFF  
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE

THURSDAY

4:30 – 6:30 PM

JANUARY 23, 2020

## 1. Call to Order

Commissioner Marks Marino called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020, to order at 4:32pm.

## 2. Roll Call

<input type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Haferkamp
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Marks Marino
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner White
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Guzman	

Others present: Jenny Niemann (Staff Liaison), Lee Bryant (Minutes), Austin Aslan (Councilmember)

## 3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comment

## 4. Approval of Minutes

**Moved by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner White to approve the December 5<sup>th</sup>, 2019, minutes.**

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

## 5. New member introductions: Ariel Coffey and Lee Haferkamp

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

All present members shared their duration on the commission and what they do in town.

**6. Business**

**A. Mountain Line Bus Rapid Transit Project (25 minutes)**

Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner, Mountain Line

Requested Action: Information and input

Ms. Collins shared information on the planning phase of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project. It is important to consider the bus run time components (in motion, passenger delays, traffic delays, other) when trying to make busses run more efficiently. Route 10 is a current example of BRT (Mountain Link) and saw a significant increase in usership in its first year. A number of stakeholders over the past year have been working together to determine where corridors would be best served by BRT. Alternatives for various BRT options were determined for all considered routes with the next steps being: targeted public outreach, coordination with ADOT on the Milton Road section, assessing proposed bus stop locations, environmental analysis, locally preferred alternatives, local funding, and federal funding applications.

Commissioner Marks Marino asked about the concerns and controversy regarding the center bus lane proposal for Milton Road. Ms. Collins explained that while center bus lanes are common (especially with light rail), restricted left lane movements, snow removal, and passenger access can be complicated. Commissioner Chamberlain asked about the timeline. Ms. Collins said that the planning phase should be completed by September 2020 but funding is an issue. If funding is awarded at the next federal application process, the earliest for implementation would be 2024.

**B. Mayor's Monarch Pledge Update (15 minutes)**

Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Antonopoulos reviewed the pledge, required actions, and steps moving forward. A number of required pledge actions are in the works or have potential in both the Regional and Climate Action and Adaptation plans. Internal partners include Parks, Sustainability, Building Managers, and Facilities, with external partners including the Arboretum, Master Gardeners, Terra Birds, and area nurseries. Preliminary research has been conducted at the cemetery and a number of proposed monarch locations throughout town have been identified. The Sustainability Section will be reaching out to the Commission for further support.

Commissioner White asked if edible strains of milkweed would be used and suggested including education on cooking with milkweed in the pledge; Ms. Antonopoulos was unsure if edible milkweeds were included, but will follow-up.

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Ms. Antonopoulos confirmed that Flagstaff is in the monarch migratory pathway, after a clarification questions from Commissioner Chamberlain. Commissioner Coffey complimented the use and diversity of proposed milkweed planting in the Southside community. Commissioner Marks Marino asked whether the timing of milkweed blooming and monarch migration are impacted by climate change and Ms. Antonopoulos and Ms. Niemann explained that it is a concern and will be considered.

Councilmember Aslan commented on the importance of this pledge for pollinator conservation as pollinators are essential for ecosystem health. His wife is a lead pollinator biologist and he volunteered her expertise as a resource moving forward.

#### **C. Flagstaff Trails Initiative Draft Regional Trails Strategy (25 minutes)**

Martin Ince, Multimodal Planner, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information and input

Mr. Ince gave an overview of the draft Regional Trails Strategy to-date. A grant was awarded two years ago to draft the plan. Trails are an essential piece of Flagstaff's identity and this strategy's overarching purpose is to improve Flagstaff's trail systems as no previous plan as laid out specifics for trail development and maintenance. The overall goal is to "elevate the regions' trails from 'good to extraordinary.'" Planning began in September 2017 with submission of a final Flagstaff Regional Trail Strategy to City, County, and federal agency leadership in spring 2020. Trail use in Flagstaff is on the rise due to increased visitation and the city's population growth. A community survey with 550 responses provided valuable information moving forward with strategy development. There are 413 miles of system trails and 335 unauthorized "social" trails that can cause environmental issues that were surveyed in the Flagstaff area. Next steps include securing a fiscal sponsor, reviewing public feedback, and presenting the strategy through an inter-organizational agreement. Mr. Ince also reviewed the online Flagstaff Trails Initiative Interactive Map and online commenting.

Commissioner Chamberlain asked if proposed trails overlay social trails, which Mr. Ince explained is sometimes the case but many proposed trails are brand new. Commissioner Marks Marino commented that the FTI draft is outstanding and that the commenting system and map are very user friendly.

A previous concern Commissioner Marks Marino had is that early on in the process there were some very vocal dissenters to bicycle use, which may make it difficult to make decisions contrary to the loudest voices. Mr. Ince appreciated this concern and expressed that the planning process was purposeful and involved all different user groups. Commissioner Chamberlain asked if there is a limit to the number of comments individuals can make and Mr. Ince clarified that there is not.

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner Guzman asked what the minimum trail length for an authorized trail was, and Mr. Ince explained that trails can be shorter than a mile to accommodate a variety of users. Commissioner Chamberlain asked if Mr. Ince had updates on the "Y" at Schultz Creek and Ms. Niemann explained that an update would come from Open Space in the Sustainability Section.

The deadline for public comment is February 7<sup>th</sup>, 2020. A member of the public (Thane Badea, resident of Greenlaw) gave a comment to ask whether the consideration of trail use for cultural purposes was included in the strategy. Mr. Ince explained that there was identification of cultural sites and that this involves an additional level of attention if trail construction takes place.

#### **D. Working Group Updates (15 minutes)**

Requested Action: Updates from Commission working groups and discussion

None of the working groups had a meeting since the last Commission meeting, so there were no updates.

Commissioner Marks Marino explained that the Transportation and Land Use working group is essentially disbanded as Brian Petersen is no longer on the Commission and Commissioner Marks Marino does not have the time to commit to being in the working group alone. Mr. Badea gave another public comment to ask Commissioner Marks Marino what the Transportation and Land Use working group had been working on. The working group had been looking into improving the decision-making process around incorporating transportation and land use decisions, working with Council and the Transportation Department.

Commissioner Coffey asked if the Rethink Waste working group included composting, and Commissioner Guzman said that the working group mainly supports the Sustainability Section's efforts and Commissioner Coffey expressed the desire to join.

Commissioner Haferkamp proposed a Light Pollution working group. Commissioner Marks Marino asked Ms. Niemann about the City's initiatives for citizen groups open to interested community members. Ms. Niemann explained that these citizen groups are currently being planned, with a Community Health group starting soon. Mr. Badea explained that he is interested in being involved in some sort of transportation-focused citizen group.

A working group will review the Increased Funding Requests (IFRs) included in the City Manager's proposed budget and the commission will vote on the final recommendations for adoption by City Council (see Discussion Item F). Commissioners Haferkamp, White, and Coffey expressed interest in reviewing the IFR's. Commissioner Coffey would be an alternate working group member if needed, and asked whether the Council climate emergency declaration would affect the

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

budget. Ms. Niemann said that will be discussed by Council if the declaration is approved.

Moved by Commissioner Chamberlain to, seconded by Commissioner Guzman to create a Budget working group.

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

**E. Committee Chair and Vice-Chair Elections (15 minutes)**

Requested Actions:

- Chair election:

Vice-Chair McCain (who could not be present) submitted a video interest statement. He has served as Vice-Chair for the last three years. As Chair or Vice-Chair he will work to bring people together to find collective solutions, working with the Sustainability Staff and other community groups.

Moved by Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve Vice-Chair McCain as the Chair.

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

- Vice-Chair election:

Commissioner White expressed his desire to serve as Vice-Chair, and that he would do it with confidence and enthusiasm.

Moved by Commissioner Chamberlain, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve Commissioner White as the new Vice-Chair.

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

**F. CAAP Integration into the FY20-21 Budget Process (10 minutes)**

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information and formation of a working group

Ms. Niemann gave an update on climate action and the budget process. Commissioner Marks Marino asked about the change in the city's budgeting system and Ms. Niemann explained that the city is moving to Priority Based Budgeting, and an expert can be brought in to a Commission meeting if Commissioners are interested. Ms. Niemann briefly reviewed the goals of the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan and how the budget process can move those goals forward. The

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Increased Funding Request (IFR) form now has three climate-related questions on it regarding mitigation, adaptation, and equity. Ms. Niemann reviewed the questions and gave examples. These questions are new to most staff members and Sustainability Section staff have held two sessions with City staff to help them understand the questions.

**G. Sustainability Section Update (5 minutes)**

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave a brief update on Sustainability Section projects and activities across all focus areas. Ms. Niemann would like to schedule an update for the Commission on the Home Energy Efficiency Rebate Program. Equity is moving to the forefront of the Sustainability Section's focus and will be incorporated in future projects and initiatives.

**7. To and From (5 Minutes) – All**

Ms. Neimann asked commissioners to attend one of the trainings they were emailed about. NAU's Coordinating Committee for Sustainability (CoCoSus) would like Commissioners to attend their meetings, with the next meeting occurring on February 12<sup>th</sup> from 8-9:15am. Commissioners Marks Marino and Haferkamp volunteered to attend the meeting and potentially serve as representatives.

There is still funding for the Water Conservation Neighborhood Sustainability Grants.

Commissioner Marks Marino encouraged everyone to attend the Tuesday, January 28<sup>th</sup> City Council meeting to support the movement of the Sustainability Section in Public Works to the City Manager's Office, and the declaration of a climate emergency and elevation of the CAAP goals.

**8. Future Agenda Item Requests**

Commissioner Chamberlain requested information on APS's new commitment to renewable energy.

Ms. Niemann suggested a future agenda item on Priority Based Budgets.

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner White requested two future agenda items: discussion of moving hazardous waste drop-off day to a different location than the Flagstaff Police Department, and the minimum wage discussion.

**9. Adjournment**

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020, adjourned at 6:35pm.

**CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at [www.flagstaff.az.gov](http://www.flagstaff.az.gov).

Dated this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2019.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison