

# MINUTES

CITY OF FLAGSTAFF  
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE

THURSDAY

4:30 – 6:30 PM

FEBRUARY 27, 2020

## 1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2020, to order at 4:32pm.

## 2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Guzman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Haferkamp
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Marks Marino
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	

Others present: Jenny Niemann (Staff Liaison), Lisa Clark (Minutes)

## 3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comment

## 4. Approval of Minutes

**Moved by Commissioner Marks Marino, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve the January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020, minutes.**

Discussion: Commissioner Marks Marino sent edits by email.

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

## 5. Business

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

#### **A. Schultz Creek Natural Area Update (5 minutes)**

Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Antonopoulos gave a brief update on the Schultz Creek Natural Area as requested by Commissioner Chamberlain. The property is located on Mount Elden Lookout Road just to the east of the "Schultz Y" private property that is widely used by the community as a parking area and unofficial trailhead. While there is a US Forest Service trailhead and parking lot located just north of the area off Schultz Pass Road, it is not accessible to all vehicles and can flood during monsoon season.

The property has an historic overlay due to the old water tank and the remnants of the Beale Wagon Road. In 2017, the property was rezoned to Open Space to provide access to the Schultz Creek area. Subsequently, public comment was gathered on what infrastructure to add to the property and most people wanted minimal development with only restrooms, interpretive signage, and a map kiosk with some amount of available parking.

These results were brought to City Council in the fall of 2019, and due to the high cost of putting in the parking lot Council directed staff to put this project on hold. The general future management of this property will be included in the Legally Designated Open Space Management Plan that will be presented to Council in March, and Open Space will only be investigating potential future actions. The City and the private landowner of the Schultz Y have discussed doing a land swap in the past to retain the current parking lot that is already heavily impacted, and there is a possibility of continuing these conversations in about a year.

#### **B. Flagstaff's Food Waste Calculator Results (25 minutes)**

Dylan Lenzen, Sustainability Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information and input

Mr. Lenzen provided an update on food waste research. Food waste is a priority to mitigate as most wasted food is edible, and about 18% of people in Flagstaff are uncertain where their next meal is coming from. There are also many benefits to reducing food waste that are in line with the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP) such as reducing the amount of methane emissions in landfills.

This research, based on two Natural Resources Defense Council studies, was intended to increase the amount of data on food waste generation in Flagstaff and determine the most impactful steps the City can take to reduce food waste. They found that individual households and restaurants/caterers were the largest producers of food waste but addressing that waste would take much more capacity than working with larger entities such as grocery stores and small retail/convenience stores. These categories had a higher potential for food rescue (i.e., giving food that would go to

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

waste to those who deal with food insecurity). Food rescue has the potential to meet about half of the need in Flagstaff, and capstone students from NAU have been surveying grocery stores to determine if there is the potential for even more food rescue.

Based on this research, the recommendation is to focus on the following actions:

- Collect food scraps from homes
- Work with food manufacturing and processing businesses to reduce waste
- Target universities and colleges
- Give assistance and support to new food donors
- Partner with local rescue organizations like the Flagstaff Family Food Center

Vice Chair White requested that the data and associated research methodology be posted on the website for the public. His concern was focused on whether edible waste was distinguished from inedible waste, but Mr. Lenzen explained that it was combined. Commissioner Coffey also requested that the results from the capstone project be shared when complete.

#### **C. Update on CAAP Integration into the FY20-21 Budget (10 minutes)**

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an overview of the CAAP integration process for the FY20-21 budget cycle. The new process requires staff to submit an Increased Funding Request (IFR) and indicate whether their request is aligned with the three goals of the CAAP: mitigation, adaptation, and equity. These requests are then reviewed by Ms. Niemann and Ms. Antonopoulos before going to the Budget Team. Ms. Niemann gave a summary of this first round of reviews that were just completed to help inform the review that will be done by the Commission's working group on the City Manager's budget.

Over 150 IFRs have been reviewed, and the process was valuable to gather data on how other city sections perceive the relationship between their projects and climate action and identify opportunities to build and improve for next year. About 75% of IFRs indicated a relationship to climate action, but Sustainability staff only supported about a third of those as actually being considered as climate action.

Commissioner Marks Marino asked whether staff would have the opportunity to revise their IFRs based on the assessment by Sustainability. Ms. Niemann explained that there is no way for them to change their IFR after submission, but a form will be provided to the Budget Team with the recommendations from Sustainability.

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Vice Chair White wanted to know if staff could provide an explanation for why any of the goals were selected, and suggested including a gradient of alignment (e.g., less or more impact) in the future. Ms. Niemann explained that there is currently no way to explain the selection in the form, but they will look into adjusting it for next year.

Ms. Niemann highlighted some of the projects that aligned most strongly with the CAAP goals, including Economic Vitality's Innovate Waste Challenge and exterior window replacement at City Hall.

The main lessons from this process have been that assessment of these goals is very subjective, but it has sparked strategic and innovative thinking among staff while improving internal collaboration. These lessons will be applied to improving the process for next year.

#### **D. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Update (5 minutes)**

Lisa Clark, Sustainability Commission Assistant

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Clark gave a brief update on the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant program and provided an overview of the program for the new Commissioners. There is still \$2000 remaining for Water Conservation projects this fiscal year, so applications are being collected for review in March. Advertising for FY21 will begin around April.

#### **E. Chair Welcome and Sustainability Commission Processes (10 minutes)**

Dave McCain, Chair, Sustainability Commission

Requested Actions: Information and discussion

Chair McCain gave an overview of his onboarding process with the Sustainability Section including his new roles as Chair (e.g., creating the agenda in consultation with Ms. Niemann). Vice-Chair White will run the meetings when Chair McCain is absent.

Chair McCain expressed interest in creating new mission and vision statements for the Commission and mentioned that he would like to meet individually with each Commissioner in the next month. Chair McCain then gave a brief history of Robert's Rules of Order and provided a refresher on the rules for voting.

#### **F. Preparation for Commission Mission Discussion at March Meeting (15 minutes)**

Dave McCain, Chair, Sustainability Commission

Requested Action: Discussion, group brainstorm on past Commission accomplishments and potential mission statements for the Commission.

The Sustainability Commission was created by Ordinance to be an advisory body for City Council and is informed by the Handbook of Commissions as well as the vision in the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP).

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

The Commissioners then brainstormed concepts for the vision statement (i.e., the world they want to create) and the mission statement (i.e., how to create that world). Those ideas are presented below:

Vision:

- Integrity
- More educated and action-oriented community
  - Inspiring the community to be interested/passionate about what the Commission does
  - Create an educational dialogue with the community
- See the CAAP through to fruition and meet those goals
  - Help to create a community (including the City) that makes decisions with sustainability at the forefront
- Build a stronger community that is interconnected and resilient

Mission:

- Serve as a conduit or liaison between community and council
- Hold council accountable (e.g., Climate Emergency Declaration)
- Community involvement, with better public engagement within meetings
- Encouraging more council engagement at commission meetings
- Supporting staff and making sure the CAAP happens as intended
- Remove barriers to community engagement

Chair McCain will send information to the Commission about the difference between a mission and vision statement and will bring ideas for each of these statements to the next meeting. Commissioners will send additional ideas to Ms. Niemann.

#### **G. Sustainability Section Update (10 minutes)**

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an update on the Sustainability Section. There are many upcoming events including the final Home Energy Efficiency workshop for the season on March 4<sup>th</sup>, NAU's Earth Jam on April 24<sup>th</sup>, and the upcoming Earth Day celebration on April 25<sup>th</sup>. The Open Space program will be presenting to City Council on March 3<sup>rd</sup> on ballot measure recommendations in partnership with Housing, Forest Management, and Parks and Recreation. Lisa Clark has started as the new Community Stewards Assistant.

The new Sustainability Leaders course has started with about 20 people participating, and the Materials Management program is continuing work on food waste and the

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

updated animal keeping code. The Climate Action program has been doing a wide variety of work including starting up a collaboration with Gotcha! for the electric bike share program and continuing work on the installation of electric vehicle charging stations in the City Hall west lot. Ramon "DC" Alatorre started as the new Climate and Energy Coordinator and will be working on projects such as RentLab and coordinating with Arizona Public Service at Red Gap Ranch.

In equity, the Sustainability Section is working on creating metrics, increasing collaborations with the Indigenous Circle of Flagstaff, having monthly equity trainings and discussions with City Staff, and started incorporating a land acknowledgement with the Sustainability Leaders program. Sustainability may also give an equity training for the Commission in the future.

#### **6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All**

Chair McCain attended a Coordinating Committee for Sustainability (CoCoSus) meeting at NAU to learn about their grants, transportation work, and research. The next meeting will be on March 11<sup>th</sup> from 8-9:15am in the Applied Research and Development building in the large pod. Matt Muchna (Sustainability Manager for NAU) offered to have a special meeting at a different time that works better for the Commissioners if needed. Other opportunities for Commissioners to engage include the Sustainability Social at NAU near the end of April and nominating community groups or individuals for Sustainability Leadership awards by March 6<sup>th</sup>.

Commissioner Marks Marino mentioned that the next Global Climate Strike will be on Earth Day (April 22<sup>nd</sup>) in the afternoon. She will send more details.

Commissioner Marks Marino highlighted that on March 17<sup>th</sup>, City Council will be discussing the climate emergency declaration. Previous discussions on January 27<sup>th</sup> ended in directing City Staff to prepare to adopt the declaration on March 17<sup>th</sup> and elevate the goals of the CAAP to carbon neutrality by 2030. Commissioner Marks Marino requested that Commissioners not provide public comment that day in the interest of time, but comments can still be provided on comment cards or online.

Councilmember Aslan was not able to attend this meeting as he is in Texas with the Mayor to meet with BNSF.

#### **7. Future Agenda Item Requests**

None

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

**8. Adjournment**

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2020, adjourned at 6:19pm.

**CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at [www.flagstaff.az.gov](http://www.flagstaff.az.gov).

Dated this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2019.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison