



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Thursday, January 24, 2019

4:30 – 6:30 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair

David McCain, Vice Chair

Eli Chamberlain

Dara Marks Marino

Amanda Vigneau

Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Nicole P. Antonopoulos

1. **Call to Order**

Chair Peterson called the meeting to order at 4:30pm.

2. **Roll Call**

 X Chair Petersen

 Vice Chair McCain

 X Commissioner Chamberlain

 X Commissioner Marks Marino

 X Commissioner Vigneau

 X Commissioner White

3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comments.

4. Approval of Minutes

A. November 29, 2018

Commissioner Marks Marino motioned to approve the minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner White. All voted in favor.

5. Business

A. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Report Out (10 minutes) – Rosemary Logan

Requested Action: Informational

Mrs. Rosemary Logan presented on Flagstaff Foodlink's Neighborhood Sustainability Grant project. They hosted a service day in May 2018 with over 40 participants and about 50 seedlings planted. They put in a miniature orchard as well as an herb spiral using native plants. Flagstaff Native Plant and Seed put in a drip irrigation system and were surprised by the amount of water they used (54,000 gallons over a five month period). She mentioned that she would like to find out the average water use for similar gardens throughout town. She noted that they did decrease the amount of water they used overall even though they increased the watering space by one third. She added that twelve families of all ages come to the garden.

B. Water Conservation Strategic Plan (10 minutes) – Tamara Lawless

Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Tamara Lawless, Water Conservation Manager, provided an update on the strategic planning process that is currently underway in the Water Conservation program. Staff hired Maddaus Water Management, Inc., a nationally renowned consultant that focuses on water conservation. Ms. Lawless mentioned that the Water Conservation program has not been as strategic as they could be towards addressing water conservation so this planning process is an opportunity to gather data and community input into a strategic plan.

Ms. Lawless showed a graph of Flagstaff's overall water consumption including reclaimed water. Residential use (multi-family and single family) makes up the largest consumers and reclaimed water users make up 23%.

The strategic planning process is organized into five phases: data collection and analysis; conservation measure selection; scenario building; draft plan; final plan and adoption, and; implementation.

Ms. Lawless presented on the water conservation measures or actions that Maddaus provided as options for water conservation. Water Conservation staff then whittled down the list to 34 measures using qualitative criteria. These criteria took into consideration water savings, feasibility, quantifiability, community preference, and other criteria.

Ms. Lawless walked through measures that the Water Conservation program already implements. These include tiered rates (single family), public education, watering schedules, toilet and other rebates, residential and commercial checkups, and others.

She then introduced some future measures that the Water Conservation program could implement if selected through the strategic planning process. These include water budgeting, golf course programming, smart meters, retrofits with schools,

higher efficiency on showerheads and faucets, rebates for washing machines, and leak assistance for low income households.

Public input will be provided through an Advisory Committee (monthly meetings), open houses with a broader stakeholder group, community meetings, and City Council and Commission meetings.

Commissioner Vigneau suggested reaching out to assistant centers in the health care system that might be interested in water conservation. Chair Peterson added that land use planning needs to be addressed in the plan.

C. Colorado Plateau Book Club (5 minutes) – Brian Petersen

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

The Commissioners did a book club in 2018 for the month of April as part of the public library's book club program. The library asks organizations to pick one book per month each focused on the Colorado Plateau. The Commission decided they would do another book club this year. Commissioner Marks Marino suggested A Great Aridness by William deBuys.

D. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (45 minutes) – All

Requested Action: Discussion

Mrs. Jenny Niemann provided an update on the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP). She and Ms. Antonopoulos have been meeting with each of the Division leaders to talk about how the CAAP affects their work and to show their support for helping the Divisions meet the goals of the CAAP.

The CAAP has 30-year goals, but Sustainability staff want to get started on achieving short-term actions now. The CAAP is a five year plan and Sustainability staff have requested a leader from each Division to make the CAAP part of their focus.

Sustainability staff will set up topic specific working groups to help meet actions in the CAAP. Working group topics identified include electric cars, climate and equity, and climate and health. The hope is to get at least two of these working groups started in 2019. These working groups will vary as far as how often they meet and for how long. These working groups will be formed based off staff and community input on what would be most helpful towards meeting the goals of the CAAP. Chair Peterson suggested a climate and land use working group as well as a working group focused on researching other cities and counties and what they are doing to successfully address climate change.

Division specific climate assessments will also be completed to help better understand Division-specific climate impacts as well as vulnerabilities. Staff will also create implementation blueprints for every action of the plan. These blueprints will help clarify timeframes, roles, etc., and can be edited and added to as needed over time. The equity checklist will be used with these blueprints as a mechanism to understand and address the cross complexities of separate Divisions.

Staff are putting together a calendar of what CAAP implementation looks like with the Sustainability Commission, City Manager's office, Council, and the community. This calendar is intended to help show what is happening towards implementing the CAAP. Climate and coffee are set for every other Friday. In addition, staff are looking into organizing a community workshop schedule with topics such as electric

cars as well as the 1.5 degree result of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.

Next, Ms. Antonopoulos gave a brief presentation on the City budget process. The City has an annual budget process over six months of the year. Funding falls into two buckets: base budgets and requests for new funding (RSL). Requests can be made for ongoing or one-time funds. Base budgets are set funds that are secured and allocated on a regular fiscal year.

Ms. Antonopoulos shared some background on the City Council's role in the budget process. She mentioned that local City Council elections used to be held in May but are now held in November with the new Council seat in December. This means that the new Councilmembers begin their terms at the start of the budget process. Since staff have to make RSLs requests based, in part, off City Council goals, the City Manager and leadership requested that the new City Council consider the goals established by the former City Council.

The new Council agreed to consider the previous Council's goals, and during the winter Council retreat staff presented updates on goals set by previous Council. This provided an opportunity for the new Council to give further direction to City leadership.

In January, staff determine what new funding is needed as per the Sustainability Section's strategic plan and or City Council's goals. In February, the Council attends a budget retreat focused on where the City is financially as an organization. It is an opportunity for Council to go into the April budget retreat understanding how "healthy" the city is.

New funding requests are due to the budget team in February for one-time and ongoing RSL funds. Staff then make pitches to the budget team. Sustainability has to prioritize over six program areas. In addition, Sustainability staff have to suggest where the money will come from since the Environmental Management fee that funds Sustainability is fully allocated.

The proposed budget then goes to Council in April. The City Manager walks the Council through the budget and Council gets to propose new line items and decide which items get funded. The final budget is completed in May and goes to Council for resolution for adoption in June.

Ms. Antonopoulos then introduced Sustainability Section's base budget (i.e., contracts and commodities). Base budget does not include staff salaries. She showed a table comparing base budgets and RSLs requests. Examples of RSLs requests include funds to increase the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant funds, funds to hire an Energy and Climate Coordinator, funds for trail management system on Observatory Mesa, funds for a waste characterization study, and funds for a trails study.

Staff are working to provide technical expertise to other sections to discuss where the CAAP falls into their budgets.

E. Sustainability Section Budget and Structure (10 minutes) – Brian Petersen

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Mrs. Antonopoulos described where Sustainability is situated within the City. Currently, the Sustainability Section is housed within Public Works although it provides support across the organization. Sustainability was originally placed under Public Works because it is funded by the Environmental Management fee. Former and current City Council members have been discussing whether or not Sustainability belongs under Public Works or as a stand-alone Division.

Chair Peterson introduced the idea of writing a letter to City Council and the Manager suggesting that Sustainability be its own Division. Commissioner Marks Marino made a motion that the Sustainability Commission write a letter and put together a presentation for City Council and City Manager that highlights the importance of elevating Sustainability to its own Division and that the City Manager and Council include this option in any discussion they have with potential City Managers. Commissioner Chamberlain seconded the motion. All voted in favor.

Commissioner Chamberlain motioned that a subcommittee be formed to draft a letter, send it to City Council and the City Manager, and present to Council. Commissioner Marks Marino seconded the motion. All voted in favor. Commissioners Chamberlain, Marks Marino, and Peterson offered to be on the subcommittee. Commissioner Marks Marino offered to write a draft.

F. Policy Incubation and Community Needs (15 minutes) – All

Requested Action: Discussion

Now that the CAAP has been adopted by Council, there is an opportunity for the Commission to use subcommittees to further the CAAP. Staff proposed three subcommittees be formed focused on policy development, community needs/outreach, and technical climate action and adaptation planning. These subcommittees would overlap and the policy subcommittee could take recommendations from the other subcommittees. Staff will put together a framework for these subcommittees and share it with the Commission in February.

G. Sustainability Commission Meeting Duration (5 minutes) – All

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

The commission discussed the length of the Sustainability Commission meetings. Commissioner Marks Marino motioned that they continue to meet for two hours each month until the subcommittees were established and to review the length of Sustainability Commission meetings thereafter. Commissioner Vigneau seconded the motion. All voted in favor.

H. Sustainability Section Update (10 minutes) – Nicole Antonopoulos

Requested Action: Informational

On February 5th, Sustainability staff will offer the City Council the opportunity to sign on to the Global Covenant of Mayors which would obligate the city to address six climate actions. A climate solutions open house will be hosted on February 1st with lightning talks.

Community Stewards program launched an Albert's Winter Snow Play Sled Pledge at three local stores and staff hosted two winter snow play cleanups with 29 volunteers.

The Energy program will host an energy efficiency workshop on March 6th at the Murdoch Center. The energy efficiency rebates have been exhausted and staff are requesting an additional \$80,000 to support this program in the next fiscal year.

The Food Policy program continues to work on animal keeping code updates. In addition, staff are looking at doing a pilot composting and food recovery program. They are working with City Parks as well as NAU.

The Open Space program will host two public meetings on the Schultz Creek trailhead on February 27th and March 2nd aimed at having a community conversation about the proposed parking lot. A survey is open to gather public input. In addition, staff are working with Water Services to secure a reclaimed water agreement for Picture Canyon that guarantees water to the Preserve in perpetuity. Finally, staff are working with ADOT to revise winter congestion suggestions that intersect Observatory Mesa (two of the three options go through the mesa). Ms. Antonopoulos noted that the land conservation easement does not allow for road development.

A plastic recycling information campaign is underway. The plastic PSA reached over 17,000 people. Twenty two people signed up for Master Recycling course this spring.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Commissioner Bousson accepted a position in Utah so had to step down from the commission. Three applications are needed before being brought to City Council. Staff requested that the commissioners recruit anyone who might be interested in joining the commission.

7. Adjournment

Chair Petersen adjourned the meeting at 6:29pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2019.
