



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Thursday, August 22nd, 2019
4:30 – 6:30 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair	Breanna Guzman
David McCain, Vice Chair	Dara Marks Marino
Eli Chamberlain	Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Jenny Niemann

MINUTES:

Lisa Clark

1. **Call to Order**

Chair Petersen called the meeting to order at 4:32pm.

2. **Roll Call**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair Petersen	<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Guzman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Marks Marino
<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner White

3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public participation.

4. Approval of Minutes

A. July 25th, 2019

Commissioner Marks Marino motioned to approve the minutes. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair McCain. All voted in favor.

5. Business

A. Sustainability Organizational Structure Discussion (30 minutes)

Commissioners, Shannon Anderson, Deputy City Manager and Andy Bertelsen, Public Works Director

Requested Action: Information and discussion

Chair Petersen gave a brief presentation to Shannon Anderson (Deputy City Manager) and Andy Bertelsen (Public Works Director) on the need for the Sustainability Section to become a Division of the City. While the Sustainability Commission is a separate entity from the Sustainability Section, the Commissioners see the value of changing the organizational structure of Sustainability in order to successfully carry out the Climate Action Adaptation Plan (CAAP) and communicate with the new City Manager.

The Commissioners discussed their recommendation with Ms. Anderson including how a similar shift in the structure of Sustainability within the City has worked well for other cities in both communication and budgeting, as reported by Chair Petersen. Commissioner Marks Marino also mentioned the need to elevate Sustainability in order to better integrate sustainable practices into every function of the City.

Chair Petersen also asked questions to Mr. Bertelsen about the relationship between the Sustainability Section and Public Works. Mr. Bertelsen reiterated the value of the Sustainability Section.

The Commission will send concrete examples of this shift in other cities to the City Manager. Ms. Anderson, Mr. Bertelsen, and the City Manager will meet with their internal team and will return to the October 24th meeting to report back.

B. Biking ordinance discussion and recommendations – Nicole Antonopoulos (25 minutes)

Requested Action: Information, discussion and vote on recommendations

Nicole Antonopoulos (Sustainability Manager), standing in for Martin Ince (Multimodal Transportation Planner with the Community Development Department), reported on the status of the electric bike (E-bike) code revisions. Currently, Class 1 and 2 E-bikes that have a maximum speed of 20 miles per hour are allowed on all sidewalks except downtown and the entire Flagstaff Urban Trail System (FUTS) except for the Nate Avery Trail and the Arizona Trail. Class 3 E-bikes, which can operate at a maximum of 28 miles per hour, are prohibited on all sidewalks and FUTS. This code has been adopted by City Council, and the Commission was asked to vote on any other trail exclusions for Class 1 and 2 E-bikes and to give suggestions related to signage.

The Commission evaluated the Nate Avery and Arizona Trails for E-bike suitability. Commissioner Marks Marino suggested that the Arizona Trail allow E-bikes as that section of the Flagstaff Urban Trail System (FUTS) is an important and common commuter route. Chair Petersen emphasized the need to retain the exclusion of the Nate Avery Trail as it is used heavily by pedestrians and is not an important commuter route. Vice Chair McCain added that if E-bikes were allowed on the Nate Avery Trail, it could affect the atmosphere of recreation at Buffalo Park with the potential for added noise and speed.

Commissioner White motioned to recommend that Class 1 and 2 E-bikes be allowed on the FUTS section of the Arizona Trail. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair McCain. All voted in favor.

Commissioner White motioned to recommend that all E-bikes be excluded from the Nate Avery Trail. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair McCain. All voted in favor.

The Commissioners were also asked whether there were any other FUTS trails where E-bikes should be excluded. Vice Chair McCain agreed with the Pedestrian Advisory Committee that E-bikes be allowed on all FUTS trails (except the Nate Avery Trail as voted on). Commissioner White motioned to recommend that no additional trails be added to the list of trails excluding E-bikes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Marks Marino. All voted in favor.

Mr. Ince has been researching ideas for the new signage along the FUTS to communicate the new E-bike code revisions and other trail etiquette. In user surveys from 2011 and 2017, some people mentioned bike safety and interactions as a concern on FUTS trails. Other communities have different systems and signs for communicating trail etiquette such as utilizing a center line and having slow signs in congested areas. Chair Petersen recommended making the signs very straightforward and clear with only one message rather than combining with other signage. Commissioner Marks Marino commented on the competing needs for investing in signage and the staff time required, as well as the immediate need for indicating where E-bikes are allowed both for E-bike users and pedestrians.

The current recommendations include having new signs and pavement markings, incorporating more dog signs and bag dispensers, creating a social media campaign, and messaging through the new bike share app.

Commissioner White asked about enforcement of the new code revisions. This was discussed at the July meeting and City Council has been discussing this issue, but there has been no decision yet on how the code will be enforced.

Chair Petersen expressed concern that the recent discussions about bikes has the potential to frame bicyclists as the enemy, but that is not the case. He suggested creating a future agenda item for the discussion of this topic.

C. Bike share update – Nicole Antonopoulos (10 minutes)

Requested Action: Information and discussion

Ms. Antonopoulos gave an update on the new bike share program. The Sustainability Section and Northern Arizona University (NAU) jointly solicited for companies that

would provide a fleet of 250 bikes. She will be relaying recommendations from Sustainability and their transportation partners and asking City Council to award a contract to one of five bidding bike sharing companies on Tuesday, August 27th.

Chair Petersen asked whether the new bikes will be docked or dockless. Ms. Antonopoulos explained that mobility hubs will be used, rather than docking systems specifically.

D. Renewable energy update – Nicole Antonopoulos (5 minutes)

Requested Action: Information and discussion

Ms. Antonopoulos gave an update on the current renewable energy work. She will be presenting to City Council on Tuesday, August 27th, about the work that will come out of the renewable energy development solicitation and identifying a path forward. This solicitation led to a letter of intent that was awarded to Next Era allowing them to negotiate with the utility for one year regarding a project proposed on Hopi land. The Sustainability Section has also been working on project ideas with Arizona Public Service (APS), so Ms. Antonopoulos will also be seeking City Council's recommendation on which path to move forward on. She will be giving a more thorough update at the September 26th Sustainability Commission meeting.

E. Commission Letter to Council on budget – revisions (15 minutes)

Requested Action: Discussion and vote to approve

The Commission discussed minor edits to the letter that will be given to Council expressing the Commission's appreciation for the FY20 budget decisions. Commissioner White motioned to approve the letter with the edits discussed. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Marks Marino. All voted in favor.

Chair Petersen will send the final letter to City Council once the edits have been made.

F. Animal keeping code update – Jenny Niemann for Dylan Lenzen (20 minutes)

Requested Action: Information and discussion

Ms. Niemann (Climate and Energy Specialist) presented for Dylan Lenzen (Community Sustainability Specialist) on the animal keeping code revisions that will be shown to City Council at a work session on September 10th. In order to make it easier to keep animals in Flagstaff, the code was revised in 2016 with the intent of maintaining an iterative process of revisions in the future.

The 2016 revisions included the following:

- Clarifications on shelter requirements and limits on the number of animals.
- Reduction of barriers toward animal keeping like distance requirements from property lines and buildings.
- Introduction of animal welfare guidelines so that there is now a space requirement per animal.

A community survey was opened to give direction to the new revisions. More than half of the respondents were satisfied with the existing code, and most people did

not find the 2016 code to be too restrictive. Most people said they would be willing to complete a permit application to keep chickens. While noise and odor were the most common nuisances reported, most people have not experienced a nuisance related to animal keeping.

Ms. Niemann reported that the 2016 code provided clear rules on how to keep animals including the number of animals, shelters, spacing, and setback requirements. The code itself is not the biggest barrier for people looking to keep animals; instead, HOAs, renting property, and small lot size are more commonly preventing people from keeping animals. There have been few complaints related to beekeeping which was new to the code, and food security has increased.

However, there have been challenges in the past three years related to enforcement and tracking nuisances. There is an incomplete record of complaints within city limits, so it is difficult to tell what the issues in animal keeping are. Animals have also not been properly contained, and there was no maximum number of total animals across all categories. Additionally, goats have had a large impact, so codes relating specifically to goats needed to be revised.

In order to address the challenges while retaining the benefits, the following revisions are being proposed:

- A free permitting process through Sustainability, Code Enforcement, and the Police Department that requires a demonstration of knowledge, basic site plan, site inspection, acknowledgement of requirements, is subject to further inspections, and notification of neighbors including a requirement for approval for goats.
- Livestock must be contained in covered animal runs as protection from predators.
- Alter setback requirements to reduce the distance from the property line and increase the distance from the dwelling units of neighbors.
- Limit total number of animals across categories based on lot size with a cap of two goats regardless of the lot.

Chair Petersen asked why the goat allowance must be contingent on neighbor approval rather than allowing goats but include removal as a consequence if there are too many nuisance complaints. Ms. Antonopoulos explained that many of the nuisances on record are related to goats. When these revisions are presented to City Council, goats will be framed as important to increasing food security.

Vice Chair McCain expressed concerns about the mandatory and free permit process potentially limiting people from keeping animals. Ms. Antonopoulos elaborated that the permit system is intended to help people think through their animal keeping systems, particularly if coops or runs are being built, so that no one will have to rebuild in order to follow the code.

Chair Petersen asked about the quality of the covered shelters, but those specifics of the code will be determined later. Commissioner Marks Marino was concerned about livestock needing to be contained at all times, as that would prevent people from letting their chickens out during the day to help with yard maintenance. Ms. Antonopoulos explained that this part of the code revision was a recommendation

by Code Enforcement, and this list of revisions is intended to give City Council options on how to move forward.

City Council's first read of the ordinance will be on October 1st and the second read will be October 15th. There will be an update on the process at the September 26th Sustainability Commission meeting.

G. Sustainability Section update – Jenny Niemann (5 minutes)

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an update on the Sustainability Section. There are many upcoming events including the Climate Leader sessions, the Fix It Clinic on September 7th, and the Flagstaff Faces of Climate Action Town Hall on September 7th. Sustainability will be involved in the Festival of Science with a hike at Picture Canyon, and there are many other events coming up in October.

Sustainability will be talking to City Council throughout the fall about many topics including renewable energy projects, the bike share program, the animal keeping code, and a new pilot program for city composting with NAU.

In Open Space, Leila Husain is replacing Kaeli Wells as the VISTA and there will be a new Indigenous Youth STEM Academy Coordinator. Open Space is also starting a media campaign about taking the bus to Open Space areas. Open Space Stewards are doing great work, and Open Space will be involved with the Flagstaff Trails Initiative.

In the Community Stewards program, there is currently a job opening for the Community Stewards Assistant position. There was also a successful Movies on the Square clean-up last week and they will be planning for Make a Difference Day on October 19th.

In Materials Management, they are currently hiring for the Materials Management Coordinator. The application is now closed, so they will be selecting someone soon.

In Climate Action, Jillian Goulet is replacing Lee Bryant as the VISTA. Ms. Bryant will be moving into a new position at the Climate Engagement Coordinator. A position will also be opening in September for the Resiliency Coordinator. Meetings have been continuing with each Section in the City on the CAAP implementation. The Climate Leaders program started on August 7th with 15 attendees, and there will be another Climate Ambassadors training in October. In addition, the application deadlines for participation in the Equity and Health Working Groups have been extended, and work has started on the Neighborhood Resiliency Programs.

Charging stations will be installed in the City Hall west parking lot. These will be the first electric vehicle (EV) charging stations downtown, and will support the City's EV fleet.

Lisa Clark (Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Liaison) reported that all recipients of the Neighborhood Sustainability Grants have been met with and all paperwork is in so the projects should begin soon when they receive their funding.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Commissioner Marks Marino reported that the Youth Climate Leadership Summit on August 10th was very successful with 25 students and 15 adults attending. The next Youth Climate Leadership Summit will be on September 7th at 1 pm immediately following the Climate Action Town Hall (moderated by Vice Chair McCain).

Commissioner Marks Marino also mentioned that she will be meeting with the Flagstaff Unified School District Board on August 27th to gain support for student action and walk-outs during the Global Climate Strike on Friday, September 20th. In addition to student actions, people will also be observing the Global Climate Strike on the south lawn of City Hall at 10 am on the same day.

Vice Chair McCain reminded the Commission that International Peace Day will be celebrated at Heritage Square on Saturday, August 21st, from 10 am-3:30 pm. The theme is “Climate Action for Peace”.

The Commission checked in on Working Groups. Each Working Group agreed to submit a 1-2 page action plan to Jenny by September 20th. Ten minutes will be allotted for each Working Group to report out at the September 26th Commission meeting.

Chair Petersen asked whether the Commission will be receiving regular updates on the implementation of the CAAP. Ms. Niemann suggested waiting on updates until the formal report is ready to be presented in November.

7. Adjournment

Chair Petersen adjourned the meeting at 6:32pm.

<p>CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE</p> <p>The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.</p> <p>Dated this _____ day of _____, 2019.</p> <p>_____</p>
--