



# MINUTES

## City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Thursday, October 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2019

4:30 – 6:30 pm

**CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL**

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

### **CALL TO ORDER**

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair

David McCain, Vice Chair

Eli Chamberlain

Breanna Guzman

Dara Marks Marino

Kevin White

#### STAFF LIAISON:

Jenny Niemann

#### MINUTES:

Lisa Clark

#### 1. **Call to Order**

Chair Petersen called the meeting to order at 4:33pm.

#### 2. **Roll Call**

  X   Chair Petersen

  X   Vice Chair McCain

  X   Commissioner Chamberlain

       Commissioner Guzman

  X   Commissioner Marks Marino

  X   Commissioner White

#### 3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public participation.

**4. Approval of Minutes**  
**A. August 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2019**

Chair Petersen pointed out an error in the Adjournment section. “Chair McCain” needed to be changed to “Chair Petersen”.

Vice Chair McCain motioned to approve the minutes with the edit above. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Marks Marino. All voted in favor.

**5. Business**

**A. NAU & City collaboration on climate action – Dr. Daniel Okoli, Vice President for Capital Planning and Campus Operations, NAU (30 minutes)**  
Requested Action: Information and discussion

Dr. Daniel Okoli and Matthew Muchna (Sustainability Manager) with Northern Arizona University (NAU) presented to and discussed with the Commission the new collaborations between NAU Sustainability and the Sustainability Section with the City of Flagstaff. Dr. Okoli expressed interest in creating a lasting partnership between the City and NAU, particularly with the new addition of Mr. Muchna to NAU’s Sustainability Office.

In the past, NAU created a Climate Action Plan with the goal of carbon neutrality by 2020 and there is currently tremendous pressure to move the plan forward. However, the goal is unrealistic as the associated actions were not laid out initially and the necessary resources were not available at the time. Dr. Okoli wants to move beyond the idea of carbon neutrality and instead focus on changing behavior on campus with very clear benchmarks to move the plan forward. Since the City just completed the Climate Action Adaptation Plan (CAAP) and there is no clear delineation of boundaries between the City and NAU, it naturally followed that NAU work with the City when creating a new Climate Action Plan so that their goals align with the CAAP.

In addition to aligning goals, NAU’s plan will still focus on carbon neutrality but with clear actions such as reducing footprint and using renewable energy (e.g., biofuels). In order to track progress on carbon neutrality, NAU will be doing a complete energy audit to determine the baseline. NAU will also further integrate sustainability into curriculum and engage with other faculty outside of the Sustainability Office including the executive team in the Coordinating Committee for Sustainability (CoCoSus). The new plan will be complete in one year after a series of community work groups, focus groups, and work sessions led and compiled by a consultant, and implementation will begin immediately afterward.

Lee Bryant and Jenny Niemann with the Sustainability Section have already begun conversations with NAU to find where the two plans already overlap (e.g., transportation, waste, and energy). The goal is to have monthly meetings with the NAU Sustainability Office and the City of Flagstaff Sustainability Section. There will also be periodic meetings between NAU executives and City Council to guide the collaboration.

Vice Chair McCain asked whether emissions have been tracked in the past at NAU. Mr. Muchna explained that some buildings have been tracked, but not all of them and it has not been done consistently. The energy audit will help fill in those data gaps.

Commissioner Marks Marino expressed appreciation for the increase in commitment from NAU. Dr. Okoli explained that he is currently driving the effort as he is particularly passionate about sustainability and making sure new projects and efforts can be maintained in perpetuity.

Chair Petersen asked what the official partnership with the City will look like. Dr. Okoli clarified that Mr. Muchna will be working on those details, but any sustainability work on campus will be overseen by the CoCoSus. Chair Petersen suggested formalizing the partnership soon in order to create some sort of city-level oversight committee as well. Mr. Muchna will present to the Commission regularly to give updates on the process, and City Council will also be given an official update.

**B. Bike share and renewable energy update – Nicole Antonopoulos (15 minutes)**

Requested Action: Information and discussion

*Bike Share*

Ms. Antonopoulos gave an update on the the joint bike share solicitation with NAU. The solicitation was brought to Council on August 27<sup>th</sup>, 2019. The focus for this solicitation was find a bike share company with an innovative system that supports CAAP goals and is accessible and available to underserved members of community, has a strong community education component, and gives the best overall value for the community and NAU.

NAU will be awarding their own contract with Gotcha Mobility

Gotcha Mobility was the top scoring bidder based on their financial model, comprehensive rate plan, social inclusion strategy, community engagement plan, and reinforcement of rider behavior. Their 250 bike fleet is hybrid, so users can choose whether to activate the Class 1 electric bike components or to use only pedals. There will be memberships available, which will give data on whether people prefer the E-bike or not.

Once Gotcha Mobility signs the contracts with the City and NAU, initial planning will begin to find dockless mobility hub locations and determine what those hubs will look like. To mitigate some of the dockless parking issues from the pilot program, there will be fees issued to user if the bikes are not parked where they are supposed to and fees issued to Gotcha Mobility if incorrectly parked bikes are not relocated in a timely manner. The process will be presented back to City Council six months after the program is launched with results from public surveys that will be similar to those used during the pilot phase.

The Commission discussed specific concerns about the program including considerations of snow, geofencing for hubs, the potential for a larger transportation hub downtown, and the use of transportation tax funds to improve safe pedestrian and bike mobility. Chair Petersen also expressed concern that the dockless bike system might prevent some people from using the bikes if they are commuting from

farther away, and suggested having a separate brainstorming session about this issue. Ms. Antonopoulos will be taking questions like these from the Commissioners on an ongoing basis until the program is launched in order to further refine the process.

### *Renewable Energy*

Ms. Antonopoulos then gave an update on the renewable energy efforts by the Sustainability Section that were presented to City Council on August 27<sup>th</sup>, 2019. In 2010, a resolution was passed that established energy efficiency and renewable energy goals including using 35% renewable energy by 2020. However, the City is currently only at 8% because Arizona Public Service's (APS) Green Choice Program is no longer a viable option as a source of renewable energy. In 2017, City Council set the goal to transition to 100% renewable energy with no specific date or timeline. With the implementation of the CAAP in 2018, the additional new goal is to have an 80% reduction of emissions by 2050. Chair Petersen also highlighted the importance of efficiency and suggested that it be brought up as a priority to City Council.

Currently, the Sustainability Section is working on improving energy efficiency and reducing peak demand by City operations, particularly wastewater treatment which encompasses 40-60% of the total energy use for the City. These efforts include city-wide energy audits and retrofits, analyzing the electricity rate structure, and educating City employees on energy use. The Commission expressed interest in inviting Water Services to a future meeting to discuss these efforts.

Sustainability is also concurrently pursuing two renewable energy efforts. The first is a 19 megawatt (MW) solar project on a Hopi parcel of land that is being negotiated by NextEra with APS. NextEra only has one year to make the negotiations, and it may be difficult for NAU to use any of that solar energy produced because of the price. Commissioner Marks Marino expressed concern about this effort moving forward.

As an additional option, the second project is directly with APS for a 50 MW (maximum) solar and wind energy development project at Red Gap Ranch that will be presented to City Council in December or January. This project has the potential for wide regional use, which will make the pricing structure more affordable. Commissioner Marks Marino asked whether energy development at Red Gap Ranch was still dependent on where water development would be located, as that impeded past efforts, but Water Services has made progress on identifying areas where the solar could go. Mr. Muchna asked why the maximum is 50 MW, and Ms. Antonopoulos explained that was the limit APS was willing to incorporate. In conjunction with the energy development at Red Gap Ranch, APS is working on developing a clean energy portfolio with benchmarks to be established by City Council soon.

### **C. Working Group Updates (20 minutes)**

Requested Action: Information and discussion

The Commissioners gave updates on each Working Group, including action items where applicable. The Equity Working Group is working with Jillian Goulet to create the Neighborhood Equity Working Groups with community members. Commissioners will support those groups in an advisory capacity by recommending projects to City Council, giving feedback, and providing funding options. The Land

Use and Transportation Working group had difficulty meeting, and would like to talk to Sara Dechter (Comprehensive Planning Manager) as well as Shannon Anderson (Deputy City Manager) and Andy Bertelsen (Public Works Director) at a future Commission meeting to give clarity moving forward. The Zero Waste Working Group had no updates. Each working group will be giving quarterly updates in the future.

**D. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Process Update – Lisa Clark (5 minutes)**

Requested Action: Information and discussion

Lisa Clark, Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Liaison, updated the Commission on the upcoming final reporting process for the FY19 recipients of the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant. Recipients will be submitting a final report including documentation of expenses, accomplishments, partnerships, and challenges. Each group will then give a short presentation to the Commission at the October meeting with a summary of their accomplishments and challenges. The following five groups will be in attendance:

1. Azulita Project
2. NAU Graduate Research – Precious Plastics
3. Killip Elementary School
4. TerraBIRDS
5. Museum of Northern Arizona

**E. Sustainability Section and Climate Leaders update – Jenny Niemann (15 minutes)**

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an update on the Sustainability Section. The following events are coming up:

- Stream Team litter clean-ups in partnership with Stormwater (10/10, 11/2)
- 15-Minute Makeover at 10:15 am on 10/15 to encourage litter cleanup around the community
- Fourth Climate Ambassador training (10/15)
- Make a Difference Day service project in the Southside drainages (10/19)
- Community tour of Picture Canyon (10/19)
- Home Energy Efficiency Workshop at the East Flagstaff Community Library with Commissioner Chamberlain (10/23, 6-7pm)
- Shred-a-Thon at Joe C. Montoya Community Senior Center (10/25)
- Drop Off Day, Dump the Drugs, and Shred-a-Thon at Flagstaff Police Department (10/26)

Sustainability will be presenting to City Council on October 15 about composting with NAU and giving recognition to the new Climate Leaders. On October 29, they will be discussing regulation of private waste haulers as part of the Rethink Waste 3-year plan. The first read of the Animal Keeping Code will be on November 5, and the one-year update of the CAAP will be given on November 26.

In Open Spaces, Alpine Leadership Academy did a cleanup on the east side of McMillan Mesa in partnership with Flagstaff Police Department and American Conservation Experience. The Indigenous Youth STEM Academy will be starting up soon with a focus on 5<sup>th</sup> graders at Killip Elementary School. Open Spaces is also working with NAU's Public Health capstone course.

Erik Sirvinskas just started with the Community Stewards Program to assist Maggie Twomey, and Adopt-an-Avenue and Adopt-a-FUTS signs are being installed. Emily Shaffer was hired as the new Materials Management Coordinator and has been planning a "Pay as You Throw" program to introduce different-sized trash containers. The pilot program for recycling inspections just wrapped up and the feedback system improved the quality of residential recycling.

The Employee Parking Reduction Program just started to incentivize City employees not to park downtown as an alternative to expanding the parking by City Hall. The CAAP reporting dashboard has launched, and the CAAP has won two awards (from Arizona Forward and the Arizona Chapter of American Planning Association). The new building codes will go into effect on January 1, 2020, and the Rental Housing Sustainability Project will be starting soon. The Sustainability Section can also now approve developments that come through the City for review, and will be continuing work with electric vehicle charging stations, CAAP implementation meetings with City sections, and partnerships with NAU's Environmental Studies courses.

The new Climate Leaders came up with many ideas for how to utilize their required 30 volunteer hours, and will be assisting with creating an online Climate Leaders course.

## **6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All**

Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned that the Sustainability Section will be hosting an open house at the new Sustainability Office on November 1 from 3-5:30pm. There will be food trucks, live music, tours at the Francis Short Pond, composting workshops, and pumpkin composting.

Commissioner Marks Marino highlighted that the Global Climate Strike was very successful with about 1,800 people in attendance including students from Flagstaff Arts and Leadership Academy, Flagstaff Junior Academy, and Marshall Elementary School. At the Strike, a petition was passed around to ask City Council to declare a climate emergency which would help elevate the Sustainability Section to Department status to better implement the CAAP. They needed 25 signatures, but got 250, so it will be on the City Council agenda as a fair item on October 16 and will be added to a future agenda if three Councilmembers agree to it.

The future Commission meetings for November and December are both over the holidays, so the two meetings will be combined into one in early December. Ms. Niemann will email Commissioners to determine a date.

The next meeting will include the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant presentations and Andy Bertelsen and Shannon Anderson will follow up with the Commission.

The Commission requested the following future agenda items:

- Water Services
- Basic presentation on energy
- Sara Dechter and Rick Barrett to talk about density and other new development issues

7. **Adjournment**

Chair Petersen adjourned the meeting at 6:37pm.

**CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2019.

\_\_\_\_\_