

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

May 28, 2020

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held May 28th, 2020, to order at 4:31pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkel
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Haferkamp
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Marks Marino
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	

Others present: Austin Aslan (Councilmember), Jenny Niemann (Staff Liaison), Lisa Clark (Minutes)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Marks Marino, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve the February 27rd, 2020, minutes.

Discussion: None

Vote: 6 – 0 Unanimously passed

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

5. Business

A. New and Retiring Commission Members (5 minutes)

Dave McCain, Chair

Commissioner Marks Marino will be leaving the Sustainability Commission after this meeting. While it was an educational experience for her over the past five years, it was taking up too much time. Councilmember Aslan and Ms. Antonopoulos expressed their appreciation for Commissioner Marks Marino's service and work with the community.

Commissioner Konkel has taken over from Commissioner Guzman. Her background is in public health, and she has worked with Sustainability staff on projects with her students at Northern Arizona University.

B. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Program Update (15 minutes)

FY19-20 wrap-up; upcoming FY20-21 grant process

Lisa Clark, Community Stewards Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information and input

Ms. Clark gave an update on the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant program. There were 10 grants awarded last summer for the FY19-20, and those recipients will soon start submitting final reports. They will be giving their final presentations at the September meeting. An additional grant was awarded to TerraBIRDS this spring for their water conservation project. Flagstaff Arts and Leadership Academy also applied, but they did not receive the award as they did not have any education or outreach planned. There are \$1105 remaining from the water conservation funds allocated for FY19-20.

Grand Canyon Youth requested an extension to their grant as they have been unable to start any of the physical work due to COVID-19 halting work.

Moved by Commissioner Chamberlain, seconded by Commissioner Haferkamp, to extend Grand Canyon Youth's grant deadline by 1 year.

Discussion: Chair McCain expressed that the project is worthy of extending as it has faced many unanticipated challenges.

Vote: 6 – 0 unanimously passed

The next round of applications is now open for FY20-21 until May 31. The Commission agreed to the proposed review process:

1. Ms. Clark will meet with the new Commissioners to get them oriented to the grant program.
2. Commissioners will read through the applications and assign scores based on the criteria in the grant information document. Only the applications that are

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

complete and eligible for the program will be sent to Commissioners. These scores will be compiled and sent back to the Commission before the June (for Water Conservation projects) or July (for Food, Waste, Climate Action, and Resilience projects) meeting.

3. During the meeting, applicants will present and Commissioners will have the opportunity to ask questions. Then the Commission will review the scores, adjust as needed, and the scores will be used to initially rank the projects followed by a decision whether to fund each applicant.

C. Update on CAAP Integration into the FY20-21 Budget (5 minutes)

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an update on the changes to integrating the CAPP into the FY20-21 budget. Initially, a Commission Working Group was formed with Vice Chair White and Commissioner Haferkamp to make budget recommendations to the Commission for recommendations to City Council. However, as all Working Group decisions need to go through the Commission and the Commission was not able to meet before the April budget retreat, the Working Group was not able to give any budget recommendations this year. Sustainability staff did incorporate climate considerations into this year's budget, and the Commission Working Group will be involved next year.

D. Environmental Management Fee Update (15 minutes)

Nicole Antonopoulos, City of Flagstaff and Neil Chapman, Flagstaff Fire Department

Requested Action: Discussion and input

Ms. Antonopoulos and Mr. Chapman gave an overview of the proposed restructure of the Environmental Management Fee and the new proposed Water Resource and Infrastructure Protection Fee. These fees would provide revenue for both the Sustainability Section and the Flagstaff Fire Department.

The intent of the restructured Environmental Management fee is to distribute the fee more equitably among customers. The current flat fee of \$4 currently put a disproportionate burden on single-family residences as they tend to use less water than high-occupancy housing units with less per capita service bills or services per contract such as water for golf courses. The new fee would be a \$0.035 consumption-based rate to also encourage people to save money by consuming less. Examples were given on how the cost for services could change for different types of customers.

The new Water Resource and Infrastructure Protection fee is intended to provide a stable and long-term funding source to maintain watershed investments and City

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

water infrastructure. Most of the work related to protecting the water supply and Flagstaff's fire-adapted forests has been funded by the Flagstaff Watershed Protection Program bond, but those funds will be exhausted within the next 6-10 months. However, the need for this work will continue to increase with the changing climate and higher risk of catastrophic wildfire. This fee would fund both permanent and seasonal staff salaries. The fee would be \$0.52 for 1,000 gallons of water used and will rise to \$0.53 by 2022.

Both fees will be on the same bill for customers. For the average low water user consuming about 3,500 gallons a month will see a charge of \$3.85. Higher water users consuming about 10,000 gallons a month would be charged \$9.97.

There is a lot of upcoming outreach planned, including additional presentations to the Open Space and Water Commissions and widespread social media outreach. City Council already gave initial direction on these proposed fees, and the first read will be on June 2 with the second read on June 16. The fee would then go into effect on August 1.

After a question from Chair McCain, Mr. Chapman explained that the new Water Resource and Infrastructure Protection fee is estimated to bring in about \$1.2 million annually. He will share the document outlining the new fee with the Commissioners.

E. APS Partnership Memorandum of Understanding (5 minutes)

Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Manager, City of Flagstaff
Requested Actions: Information and discussion

Ms. Antonopoulos gave an overview of the new clean energy Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with APS. The agreement is to increase clean and affordable energy to customers in Flagstaff, among many other benefits including reduce emissions of greenhouse gases and boost local and state economies. The MOU outlines a shared vision to help APS provide 100% clean energy by 2050. An annual shared work plan will be developed, and the City and APS will be able to share resources. This agreement should complement existing projects like Red Gap Ranch, electric vehicle charging stations, and the new solar parking canopies at the Northern Arizona Center for Entrepreneurship and Technology.

F. COVID-19 discussion (45 minutes)

How the Commission can support the City's work on economic recovery and sustainability; resilience challenges and successes in Flagstaff; how COVID-19 affects climate goals.

- Sustainability Section update on activities – Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff (10 minutes)
- Discussion – All (35 minutes)

Requested Action: Discussion

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Facing a sustainability crisis/challenge

Ms. Niemann gave a comprehensive update on the work being done by the Sustainability Section. Staff have transitioned to working fully remotely but all operations have continued, both new and existing events have moved online with only Earth Day being fully cancelled, and uplifting actions are being posted on social media. There will be a virtual tour of Open Space on June 3, and City Council will be receiving an update on the Rethink Waste Plan on June 9. The Climate Emergency Declaration that was supposed to be officially considered by City Council in March is now on the agenda for June 23. All programs in Sustainability are continuing with special consideration for COVID-19 impacts, and there are three new interns from Northern Arizona University and three new Americorps VISTA members joining the Sustainability team.

Ms. Antonopoulos outlined COVID-19 recovery activities that Sustainability has been involved in. "Building Community Together" has become the foundation for all work done in Sustainability. There are many projects ready to implement if additional funding comes in such as advancing bike and pedestrian infrastructure and vertical farming efforts. One planned project is to implement a program (based off of successful programs in other cities) to employ people experiencing homelessness to help pick up litter around Flagstaff for a daily stipend. Existing funds and staff time have been directed to efforts like increasing energy efficiency rebates, increasing community garden plots, and enhancing RentLab outreach.

As the city of Flagstaff is currently facing a sustainability crisis, the Commission discussed projects and programs that are already happening in the community and the possible role of Sustainability and/or the Commission.

Projects in the community:

- The Kinlani Mutual Aid Project is supporting communities in Flagstaff and on the reservation.
- St. Mary's Food Bank has been providing take-home activity kits instead of having kids come there to do activities.
- There has been advanced food distribution at schools and other locations.
- City Council and Flagstaff's shelters were able to move many people into empty hotel rooms.
- Kahtoola hosted a virtual running race as a fundraiser for the Havasupai Tribe.
- Red Feather has been doing lots of volunteer work on the reservation and will be building handwash stations on June 3 and June 6. They can use more volunteers.

Sustainability's role:

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

- Think about engaging the unemployed to help at-risk populations with groceries or other errands, help with invasive species removal, or help create safe fire spaces.
- Track what is working in the community to inform future work on the Resilient Neighborhood Network.
- Employment freezes and furloughs at the City should be a last resort to not add to the unemployment issue.
- Moratorium on evictions will be lifted soon and need think about how to proactively help people to avoid a housing crisis as well.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Ms. Niemann will be going on maternity leave in late July, so there will be some shifts in staffing soon for Commission meetings.

Ms. Niemann and Chair McCain are working on trying to fit in agenda items that were planned for March and April. In June, the Commission will get an update on the water conservation strategic plan.

Commissioner Marks Marino encouraged the Commission to attend the June 23 City Council meeting to show support for the Climate Emergency Resolution. This will be a virtual meeting at 3pm, but Ms. Antonopoulos will pass along any changes. Commissioner Marks Marino, with support from Commissioner Coffey, urged the Commission to continue keeping climate at the forefront of our conversations as we recover from COVID-19 impacts.

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

- Reimagining the future
- Talk about economic and sustainability implications of COVID-19 locally and nationally

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on May 28th, 2020, adjourned at 6:33pm.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2019.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison