

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

January 28, 2021

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held January 28, 2021, to order at 4:30 pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Kauffman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkell
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Dailey
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	

Others present: Dylan Lenzen (Staff Liaison), Lisa Clark (Staff Liaison), Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Jenny Niemann (Staff Liaison) Stephanie Sarty (Presenter)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Konkell, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve the December 3rd, 2020, minutes.

Vote: 7-0 Unanimously Passed

5. Business

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

A. Current Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Cycle Update (5 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion & Vote

Ms. Molloy gave an update on the current Neighborhood Sustainability Grant cycle. The Water Conservation Grant still has \$4,000 and the Sustainability Grant still has \$3,370.78. The Grant is set to close for applications on February 5th. As of this meeting time, there were no complete applications. She provided a few options for how the Commission could proceed: continuing with the current timeline, extending the application deadline by a month, rolling over funding leftover from this grant cycle to the next one, or increasing grant amounts awarded per project.

Commissioner Konkel asked if there are no applications at the end of this cycle if funding could be rolled over at that point. Mr. Lenzen said it could be done with a motion stating that. Commissioner Konkel stated that she thought it would be the most fair and least confusing thing to do. Chair McCain asked how people have responded in past cycles. Ms. Clark stated that last year there was a similar issue. There were only two applications by the end of January with a similar timeline. The Commission left applications open for one more month and received one additional application. There were only Water Conservation Grant funds left to award at that point.

Chair McCain asked if it was possible to roll funds over. Mr. Lenzen said it may have been a timing issue in the past. There is a deadline for staff to enter roll over requests. If a decision is made now, it should be possible to make that deadline. Ms. Niemann added that funds hadn't been rolled over in the past because they were for Water Conservation which has a different funding source. Chair McCain asked if Commissioner Konkel's preference was to look at applications received and to roll over funds if there are no applications received. Commissioner Konkel confirmed this, adding that extending this cycle would put it very close to the next cycle.

Moved by Commissioner Konkel and seconded by Vice Chair White to keep the current timeline for the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Cycle. If no applications are received or the Commission does not

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

wish to fund applications received, Grant funds will be rolled over to the next cycle if possible.

Commissioner Konkel asked if the Commission should have a contingency plan while waiting on confirmation from Mr. Lenzen that the funds could be rolled over. Commissioner Dailey asked if it was possible to do a rolling application process and keep it open until winners are selected. Chair McCain responded that the Commission has done this in the past, and it did not work well.

Chair McCain asked about increasing Grant award amounts. Ms. Molloy explained that they could award more money to projects instead of the current \$2,000 cap. Applications may need to redo their budget, but this could allocate more funds to fewer projects. Chair McCain asked how many applications were currently submitted. Ms. Molloy responded that there were none. Commissioner Konkel stated that this could be unfair with funds already awarded in this same cycle and for future cycles and that she does not support that option unless the amount is changed for future awards. Chair McCain agreed. They decided to keep the motion and add another motion as a contingency.

Vote: 7-0 Unanimously Passed

Chair McCain asked for a contingency if the funds are unable to be rolled over. Commissioner Konkel proposed that the Commissioners could send Grant information around to increase applications. Chair McCain agreed that it was an important strategy and asked Ms. Molloy to share the information.

Moved by Chair McCain and seconded by Commissioner Kauffman to delay the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant cycle by a month in the case that no applications are received that the Commission wishes to fund and it is not possible to roll over funds to the next cycle.

Vote: 7-0 Unanimously Passed

B. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant – Changes to Water Conservation Funding (15 minutes)

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Lisa Clark, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Discussion & Vote

Ms. Clark has been talking with Tamara Lawless in Water Conservation on how to get more interest in applications for Water Conservation Grants in future cycles. One option was to increase funding to \$3,000 or \$4,000 per project so bigger, more innovative projects could be completed. Ms. Lawless can take a decision made by the Commission today and look into how to move forward.

Chair McCain asked how much was currently available for Water Conservation Grants. Ms. Clark answered that there is \$6,000 total for one fiscal year.

Commissioner Konkel expressed support for increasing the cap for Water Conservation Grants, stating that it would make sense to split it into two \$3,000 projects. She asked if applicants would still be required to indicate the estimated water saved as previous projects have struggled with this. Ms. Clark explained that this requirement came from Water Conservation and that their consent would be required to remove or change that stipulation. She said it is possible to rework that requirement so it is less intimidating and that she would follow up with Ms. Lawless.

Commissioner Chamberlain expressed support for this concept.

Moved by Chair McCain and seconded by Commissioner Coffey to increase the amount for Water Conservation Grant awards to \$3,000 for the next Neighborhood Sustainability Grant cycle.

Vote: 7-0 Unanimously Passed

C. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant – Extension Request (Azulita Project) (5 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Discussion & Vote

Ms. Molloy reviewed a letter from the Azulita Project about their Neighborhood Sustainability Grant status. They have not ordered their recycling bins yet because their school programming continues to be

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

impacted by COVID with little chance of returning to in person work any time soon. They requested that the Commission consider an extension to complete their Grant next school year or an alternative program to provide students with bins, signage, and education needed to set up at-home recycling systems.

Commissioner Kauffman asked how pick up would be handled for the alternate project. Ms. Molloy responded that she could follow up to see what the plans were. Chair McCain asked if Commissioner Kauffman's support for the alternate project would be contingent on a pick up plan. Commissioner Kauffman replied that she liked the idea but needed to see a plan that completed all the required steps.

Vice Chair White said he thought COVID was a valid reason for the project to have been delayed and was supportive of an extension. Commissioner Dailey asked if the funds had to be spent by the end of the fiscal year. Mr. Lenzen answered that they do not.

Commissioner Coffey expressed a preference for the extension. Commissioner Chamberlain and Commissioner Konkel agreed.

Motioned by Commissioner Konkel and seconded by Commissioner Kauffman to approve an extension for the Azulita project to complete their project in the next school year when in person learning has resumed.

Vote: 7-0 unanimously passed.

D. Beautification and Public Art Commission and Sustainability Commission Collaboration Update (5 minutes)

Commissioner McCain

Requested Action: Information

Chair McCain gave an update on the Beautification and Public Art Commission funds proposal for a \$20,000 project based on climate change and hope. BPAC approved the project during their retreat on January 11th. The art will be displayed on NAIPTA bus wraps. Mr. Lenzen reported that BPAC still has to talk about exactly what the art piece will look like. BPAC

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

discussed potential themes and placement, but most of that remains undecided at this point.

E. Traffic Impacts from the Hub (25 minutes)

Stephanie Sarty, Transportation Engineering Project Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Sarty gave a presentation on the traffic impacts from the HUB. Data from Mountain Line Route 10 shows a 79.8% increase in use. The HUB accounted for a 60.1% increase. The HUB has 211 private parking spaces. NAU purchased granny's closet adding 48 parking spaces available to HUB residents. SkyView, a sister property on NAU campus, shares some HUB parking spots. Only 263 students brought their cars and needed parking. The largest traffic increase was west bound on Phoenix, west of Mikes Pike at 23.5%. This was consistent with the Transportation Impact Analysis estimates. The turning movement TIA count predicted more traffic than what HUB added. She explained that next time, the City can improve these projects by including higher transit trip reduction and by assuming that some parking may occur off site when the parking spaces available are less than other measured projects. Turning Movement Counts from the HUB added 5% traffic volume in midday peak hours and 18.3% in pm peak hours. The crosswalk at Butler and Humphreys was studied, and it was determined that the existing CRFB does not need to be updated at this time. It was also determined that the all-way stop at San Francisco and Franklin did not need a signal at this time. Future analysis will be done as NAU and the City continue to grow. There is still money for these improvements. Because parking is limited at the HUB, the assumption can be made that residents opted to not bring their vehicles.

Chair McCain asked what the original Level of Service grade was for the HUB. Ms. Sarty responded that the grades varied for every intersection. The crosswalk at Butler and Humphrey's needed improvement and money for the future to keep traffic at a reasonable rate. This was also the case for San Francisco and Franklin. These crosswalks that were likely given a Level of Service grade of D and required a proportional share of money for improvements to be given.

Vice Chair White asked what the money the HUB gave for improvements

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

to roads and intersections would be used for. Ms. Sarty responded that the current crosswalk has a circular rapid flashing beacon, and the money is for a pedestrian hybrid beacon. Vice Chair White asked what percentage of this upgrade would be covered by the \$100,000 given by the HUB and what the timeline would be. Ms. Sarty said that they are waiting for the new beacon to be warranted by increased pedestrian numbers. Jeff Bauman also answered that \$300,000 was needed for this upgrade. The HUB gave \$200,000 for a traffic signal on San Francisco, which is half the cost for that project.

Commissioner Dailey asked if there was a long-term development plan for Granny's Closet and if the City retains funds for pedestrian improvements until specific conditions at those intersections warrant spending them. Ms. Sarty confirmed that the City will hold on to those funds for an unlimited amount of time until conditions warrant spending them or until NAU makes improvements on Franklin and San Francisco. If that is the case, NAU would then be given those funds. She had no information on Granny's Closet. Commissioner Dailey asked if the City could spend those funds on other high priority pedestrian infrastructure. Ms. Sarty responded that she is not sure how the DA is written for those locations, but she believed they had to be used for the same area.

F. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan Update – Proposed Revisions and Feedback (40 minutes)

Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Director, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Information & Discussion

Ms. Antonopoulos was not able to make this meeting. Chair McCain asked if the Commission needed to talk on this topic before it was presented to Council next month. Mr. Lenzen said with the new timeline, there is no update to Council next month. Ms. Niemann confirmed that the next update to Council is on March 9th with the draft plan. The final plan will be presented to Council in April.

G. Introduction to Commission Mission Discussion (10 minutes)

Commissioner McCain
Requested Action: Information & Discussion

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Chair McCain would like the Commission to create vision and mission statements. He said this would help the Commission have a clear idea of what they do and what they want to do moving forward. It would also help Council have a clear idea on the Commission's focus, help the public understand how the Commission works and what they do, and help the public become more involved in that work. Creating these will be a multi meeting process. He asked the Commissioners for thoughts on taking the time to create those documents. Commissioner Konkel, Commissioner Chamberlain, and Commissioner Coffey all agreed that it would be valuable and important.

Chair McCain explained the process they will take. He would like the Commission to have a good understanding of the Commission's constitution and documents of origin including an Ordinance passed in 2007. They should then have an understanding of the work the Commission has done over last few years and of the distinction between vision and mission statements. The commission will then move into a brainstorming process. A working group could work on the exact language.

Commissioner Konkel asked how much the vision and mission statements should map to the 2007 Ordinance versus what the Commission has accomplished over the past few years if there has been any deviation. Chair McCain answered that it was up to the Commission to answer that question. He said it was important to start the process with the Ordinance for grounding. Commissioner Konkel asked if the City had to approve their mission and vision. Mr. Lenzen said he would check in with the City Clerk.

Chair McCain proceeded to review a few documents with the Commission including Ordinance no. 2007, a summary of what the Commission has undertaken in the last 3 years, and a document detailing the difference between vision and mission statements.

Chair McCain asked if they were still committed to the US Mayor's Climate Protection Agreement. Ms. Niemann answered that they are still committed to Paris Agreement goals. The US Mayor's Climate Protection Agreement has evolved into the US Climate Mayor's Agreement. They have repledged to this and how it relates to Paris Agreement. Chair McCain asked if there was nothing the Commission does outside of work

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

with the CAAP that would fall under that agreement. Ms. Niemann responded that the Mayor's Climate Protection Agreement is a separate document and that some of the work does fall outside of that.

The documents reviewed by Chair McCain will be sent to the Commission to review. They will cover this more deeply in the next Commission meeting.

H. City of Flagstaff Budget Process Update (10 minutes)

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information & Discussion

Ms. Niemann explained how staff is integrating climate action into the City's budget process. All City Staff are asked to submit climate action information in new budget requests. Staff is then able to track and collect information on what climate action is occurring across the City. Staff was able to incorporate three questions into the fiscal year 2021's budget request form (Does this item reduce City or community greenhouse emissions? Does this item make Flagstaff more resilient to change? Does this item increase community equity?). Because these were yes/no questions, 72% of budget requests said they were related to climate action. Sustainability staff reviewed these and think only 25% were related to climate action. Staff decided to move away from yes/no questions and provide better education across the organization to help sections align with climate goals. They have written new questions for the budget process (What CAAP strategy does this Program Change Request help you achieve? How does this PCR increase community equity? Provide additional information to support your climate action responses).

Chair McCain asked if the data from these questions goes to the Budget Team to determine what they will fund. Ms. Niemann answered that the data will go to both the Budget Team and to the Sustainability Section. Sustainability staff will fact check answers and send them to the Budget Team who will be able to use that information in their decision-making process.

Chair McCain asked if staff needed Commission support this year. Ms. Niemann answered that staff does not have an update for the Commission

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

yet but will have update for how the Commission will be involved in this budget process by next month's meeting.

I. Sustainability Section Update (5 minutes)

Dylan Lenzen, Sustainability Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Mr. Lenzen gave a brief update on the Sustainability Section. Summer White is the new Sustainable Food Systems Vista. She will be working on community gardens and increasing access to local food in Flagstaff. She will be in future Commission meetings providing updates. Climate Emergency Open Houses are taking place on February 11th and 17th from 6pm-7pm on Zoom. Links to register will be on the Sustainability Facebook page. Climate Ambassadors trainings are on February 24th and 25th. There is also a beginner gardener series in March. Staff is currently working on a commercial food scraps pilot. They are recruiting grocery stores and restaurants to participate. Food will be taken to NAU as part of a composting IDA to investigate costs. Staff is also preparing for the 2021 community garden season. There was a lot of interest in community gardens last year, and staff is hoping to support that interest this year with additional garden spaces. The O'Leary garden struggles with visibility, participation, and engagement. Staff is working with the Beautification Team on a public art project to better brand the community garden and provide a public space with seating. Community Stewards Snow Play Clean Ups have taken place on January 4th and 28th. They were featured in the Daily Sun. The Solar United Neighbors Coop has launched. This program supports residents considering solar by reducing cost with bulk purchasing. This program is a partnership between the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, and the City of Sedona. As of January 27th, 59 members have signed up. Three electric vehicle charging stations are in the planning stages at the Aquaplex, the Flagstaff Main Library, and the Flagstaff Airport.

Ms. Niemann said the Ms. Antonopoulos gave a comprehensive update on January 12th to Council. Right now, staff is working on how to get to climate neutrality. The next part is developing the Carbon Neutrality Plan. This will be an addendum to the CAAP with moved up deadlines. On March 9th, staff will be reviewing the Carbon Neutrality Plan draft with Council. On April 6th they will be presenting the final document to Council to be voted on. Staff welcomes the Commission's feedback prior to the

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

next Commission meeting, but they can also talk about it in the February Commission meeting.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

None

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

Commissioner Coffey requested information on the Arizona State legislator attempt to reverse renewable energy standards through the Arizona Corporation Commission and how this would affect the City and the Carbon Neutrality Plan. Ms. Niemann answered that staff has been working to spread the word about this attempt and that it would be detrimental their goals. Chair McCain asked about the timeline for this and if it was already on the docket. Ms. Niemann answered that she was not sure but that it was perhaps heard this week.

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on January 28, 2021 adjourned at 6:34pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2020.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison