

# MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF  
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

**THURSDAY**

**June 24, 2021**

**ONLINE MEETING  
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

**4:30 – 6:30 PM**

## **1. Call to Order**

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held June 24th, 2021, to order at 4:30 pm.

## **2. Roll Call**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Kauffman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkel
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Dailey
<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	

Others present: Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Andrew Iacona (Presenter), Avi Henn (Presenter), Steven Eiss (Presenter), Christine Cameron (Presenter), Nicole Antonopoulos (Sustainability Section Director)

## **3. Public Comment**

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No Public Comment

## **4. Approval of Minutes**

**Moved by Commissioner Chamberlain, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to approve the May 27th, 2021 minutes.**

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

**5. Business**

**A. NAU CAP Update**

Andrew Iacona, Project Manager, and Avi Henn, Manager of Sustainability, Northern Arizona University

Requested Action: Informational

This item took place after Business item E. Letter of Recommendation for the Downtown Mile Project.

Andrew Iacona and Avi Henn gave a presentation on Northern Arizona University's (NAU) Climate Action Plan (CAP). They have updated their schedule after meeting with a consultant. Their goals include reducing and eliminating emissions, utilizing NAU as a living lab, aligning with regional priorities, and building resilience. They presented a breakdown of the scope of NAU's Greenhouse Gas Emissions. Most of their emissions came from on-site heating and cooling and purchased electricity. They then presented on their evaluated pathways to carbon neutrality. To reduce electricity consumption, they looked at off-site renewables through utility and off-site renewables via virtual Power Purchase Agreements (PPAs). The two major options for removing gas and fossil fuel emissions in heating buildings were to install heat pumps or a biomass plan. They are continuing to evaluate each of these options before recommending the best solution to the President of NAU. They have created a CAP working draft and are looking to partner on a large-scale renewable energy project or enter a virtual PPA within the next five to ten years to help with emissions from electrical load. They are hoping to begin an incremental transition to a new heating system shortly after the plan is adopted which will take up to ten years to fully implement. Lastly, they have been chipping away at electrifying their fleet. The CAP will be finalized later this summer.

Commissioner Dailey asked if NAU's development of biomass would be subject to Coconino County's Renewable Energy Ordinance. Mr. Iacona answered that they did not know about the ordinance. While they would not be subject to it as NAU is considered State land, it is something they would want to understand and consider in order to align with regional priorities.

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

#### **B. Northern Arizona Healthcare Presentation Regarding the Proposed Fort Tuthill Campus**

Steven Eiss, Vice President of Construction & Real Estate Development, Northern Arizona Healthcare

Requested Action: Informational and Discussion

Steven Eiss presented on the plan for the Northern Arizona Healthcare's (NAH) Health Village concept. The concept started around a replacement hospital for the Flagstaff Medical Center as the current facility has been struggling to keep up with healthcare trends, technologies, and advancements. They submitted a zoning application package on April 30<sup>th</sup> with the concept of a holistic health village for Flagstaff and Northern Arizona. It would include onsite housing, retail, research, and innovation components as well as hotel and conference space to facilitate patients, visitors, and medical education. They are in the community outreach portion of planning, gathering feedback to include before a more formal submission later this year. The planning and zoning meeting is scheduled for October and they will go before City Council in December. They just hired an architect in May and selected general contractors, including Loven Contracting to help keep the work base local. The project will be funded by NAH with cash or bonds and no cost to taxpayers. They are meeting with City traffic engineers, ADOT, and Mountain Line to reduce traffic impacts and to bolster walkability, bike-ability, and public transportation. In their discussions with Mountain Line, they are looking to support Ft. Tuthill and the airport along with their development. They are working with the Parks Department to ensure coordination with the existing FUTS and to avoid impacts on their land during construction. They are hoping to achieve a minimum 30% reduction in energy consumption from the current health center. They are in discussion with the City about what the current medical center can become. The outpatient portion of the new facility is projected to open in 2024 with the new hospital opening late 2026.

Vice Chair White expressed concern about the increased time for people in ambulances or otherwise to get to the new facility. He said the main way to get to the hospital is via Milton and noted the congestion on that road. Mr. Eiss said they are actively working through a traffic impact analysis and are finding that most of the traffic patterns do not come down Milton but instead down the freeways. He also noted that the majority of patients are not from the City of Flagstaff. EMS travel times are being looked at as well. He said there may be some modifications that need to be made from a traffic perspective, but there are no expected delays for most patients in the new location.

Chair McCain asked about the surrounding development's funding and timeline. Mr. Eiss said they plan to go to the development market while retaining rights to the land

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

and what is developed to make sure it maintains the intent of the health village. The entire development could be 20 years out. The land directly north and south of the hospital would be the first to develop after the opening in 2026 and are intended to be retail space, restaurants, residential units, and medical office buildings for non-employed physicians.

Commissioner Chamberlain asked if they had done any studies on the increased carbon emissions for the vehicle miles traveled (VMT). Mr. Eiss responded that they could extrapolate out of the traffic impact analysis. He said the patient piece would be negligible, but the staff piece would be something to look at. He also said the increase could be offset with a more efficiently run building than the current facility.

Vice Chair White asked if the traffic analysis was available for the public to look through. Mr. Eiss confirmed this, saying it was part of the zoning submission. Vice Chair White asked how long it would take for the new facility's energy savings to offset construction. Mr. Eiss responded that they are still early in the process and the building has not been designed yet. He said they are looking at keeping as much local as possible to help minimize truck traffic and to reduce emissions and traffic impacts of out-of-town workers.

Commissioner Dailey said if the VMT does show an increase, they could consider funding a separated bike lane on Beulah.

Chair McCain asked how the Commission could continue to be connected to the discussion around this development. Mr. Eiss said they can contact him or Tiffany Antol with any questions. He also said they will continue to reach out to groups throughout the planning process and can continue to bring more details.

**C. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Application Review**

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote.

Chair McCain presented the changes to the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant made by the working group, including: changes to scoring and application deadlines; the separated-out Water Conservation Research Grant's guidelines and evaluation sheet; the increased Grant award amount of \$5,000; the added categories of Building Energy, Public Health, and Transportation and their objectives; paying compensation with no more than 50% of funds awarded; added evaluation criteria of Project Innovation up to four points; a one point Weighted Category Score for Resilience, Public Health,

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Transportation, and Building Energy; an increase to a maximum of 5 points for the Project Rational score.

Commissioner Dailey asked for clarification on the weighted scores and Chair McCain confirmed that the weighted categories receive one point.

Commissioner Konkel asked for confirmation that the Water Conservation grants were on the same timeline and procedures as the Neighborhood Sustainability Grants and if they are only using the \$6,000 from Water Services for those projects. Chair McCain confirmed this.

Commissioner Dailey asked how the prescriptive projects will benefit the neighborhood and if the evaluation criteria should be changed. Chair McCain asked for the reasoning on the Water Conservation Project Objectives. Ms. Molloy answered that Water Services wanted to focus on projects that helped community centers and more public institutions rather than someone's house. Chair McCain also noted that they wanted to separate out the marketing because they wanted to focus on community organizations. Commissioner Dailey said it was an excellent point and was appropriate to maintain a community focus. Commissioner Konkel asked if the phrasing of Project Rational should be changed from benefiting the neighborhood to benefitting the community to remove overlap with the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant. Chair McCain agreed and the change was made.

Vice Chair White and Commissioner Chamberlain expressed support for the changes.

**Moved by Commissioner Konkel, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to approve all changes to the Neighborhood Sustainability and Water Conservation Research Grants.**

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

**D. Introduction to Neighborhood Sustainability Scoring Exercise**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational

Marissa Molloy gave a brief overview of the practice scoring exercise the Commissioners will do in July. They will be scoring a previous application with the new evaluation sheet. Ms. Molloy mentioned that the old application would not have been asked to meet some of the criteria for the current evaluation sheet and asked the Commissioners to use their best discretion. The application will be sent to the Commissioners to score the week of

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

June 28<sup>th</sup>, and scores should be returned by July 19<sup>th</sup> so they can be compiled and discussed in the July 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting. Chair McCain added that they will be averaging the scores and the Commissioners should bring their own scoring sheets to the meeting to spark any conversation they may have.

Ms. Antonopoulos said that Ms. Molloy will be acting liaison until the new Community Sustainability Specialist is brought on and trained.

**E. Letter of Recommendation for the Downtown Mile Project**

Christine Cameron, Project Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

This item took place at the beginning of the business items.

Christine Cameron gave a quick overview on the Downtown Mile Project that would add to pedestrian and bike infrastructure. They requested a letter of support from the Sustainability Commission for a grant they are applying for. The projects are in various stages of funding and design, and BNSF is requiring mitigation measures for the construction of these trails as all of the projects are in close proximity to each other and to the rail. They are looking for a planning grant to pull everything together. The RAISE grant will meet their needs, and the grant criteria are compatible with the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan.

Commissioner Dailey asked for clarification on the map. Ms. Cameron answered that the Rio de Flag Flood Control Project Channel was displayed on the map in blue. Commissioner Dailey asked if the Sustainability Commission was to endorse the whole project. Ms. Cameron answered that they provided a letter the Commission can edit, and she would leave it at the Commission's discretion as to what they would support. Commissioner Dailey asked Chair McCain for clarification on what the goal was for this meeting. Chair McCain asked when the letter was due. Ms. Cameron answered it was due on the 12<sup>th</sup> of July. Commissioner Dailey said he was comfortable endorsing everything except for the project related to the Lone Tree Overpass. He said the Lone Tree Overpass project did not align with the recently passed Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP) which holds VMT at 2019 levels. He said the Lone Tree Overpass project would lead to increased traffic and he would like to remove reference to that item in the letter. He wanted to make the Sustainability Commission's concerns clear but wasn't sure if the Grant could be only partially funded with the parts they agreed with. Ms. Cameron said this grant would not go towards funding the Lone Tree Overpass project as it was already funded in Prop 420 in 2018. Instead, the funds will go towards coordinating all the listed projects along with the required BNSF mitigation.

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner Konkell asked where the RAISE grant funding came from. Ms. Cameron answered that it has had other names in the past, but that it is an infrastructure grant funded through the Department of Transportation. Commissioner Konkell asked if the letter of support was to acquire funding to help with coordination and to increase the City budget to work on these projects. Ms. Cameron confirmed this, saying that it would prepare them with deliverables to go for a design and construction grant in 2023. Commissioner Konkell expressed support for the letter as written.

**Moved by Commissioner Konkell, seconded by Chair McCain to support the letter for the City of Flagstaff's application to the RAISE Grant.**

Commissioner Dailey said that with one of these projects being counter to the CNP, they should not proceed with planning, even with the coordination of the other actions that do align with the CNP. He said one of the building blocks of the CNP is a deemphasizing of travel in single occupancy vehicles and holding VMT and single occupancy vehicles at 2019 levels. He recognized that the Lone Tree Overpass project was approved by voters in 2018 but said circumstances have changed. He said looking at the future of Flagstaff, it doesn't make sense to spend \$73 million on a bridge even if it has sidewalks and a bike lane and that it's still fundamentally planning for a future with more usage of single occupancy vehicles which per the CNP does not exist. Commissioner Chamberlain said he understood Commissioner Dailey's point, but that the project was moving forward and if the Commission could support the other projects it would increase biking and walking in the city. He said the benefits outweigh the downfalls. Commissioner Konkell said the purpose of this grant would be to have the funding to dedicate personnel to work on a master plan that would hopefully increase the likelihood of pedestrian friendly walkways and bike paths alongside the Lone Tree Overpass project. She said excluding the Lone Tree Overpass from this letter would not exclude it from the master plan. Chair McCain agreed that there was a conflict between the overpass and the CNP. However, he said he supported the letter since the overpass has been approved and will be built. Commissioner Dailey said the inevitability of the Lone Tree Overpass project was perhaps overstated. He noted that City Council recently approved the start of land acquisition for the project. He said it is not a done deal and it would be good to take it back to the voters. Commissioner Konkell suggested it be a unique agenda item, and said it was a different problem than whether the Commission should support a grant application. She said she was still in support of letter, but that the Commission should advise City Council on that project. Chair McCain agreed that Commissioner Dailey should suggest it as a future agenda item.

Vote: 4-1 passed with Commissioner Dailey in dissent

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

**F. Phase 4 Re-entry Discussion (5 minutes)**

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Discussion

Chair McCain started a discussion on how the Commission would like to meet when the City reaches Phase 4 of Re-entry. The City is currently in Phase 3 of reopening. In Phase 4, the Commission may meet in person. They discussed whether to meet in person, to continue with virtual meetings, or to use a hybrid model. They also discussed where they would prefer to meet.

Commissioner Konkel was supportive of going back to meeting in person but requested the ability to call in if Commissioners are out of town. She said her overall vote would be hybrid with the option to call in. Commissioner Dailey agreed, saying he was looking forward to meeting in person but would like the ability to call in as he travels frequently. Commissioner Chamberlain and Chair McCain agreed. Vice Chair White agreed but noted he would probably wear a mask and encouraged others to as well.

Chair McCain said that the Sustainability Commission's original meeting place had been the City Council chambers. He said they have also met in different conference rooms in City Hall and that the Sustainability Office would be an option as well. Chair McCain asked if the decision to have hybrid meetings would limit their choices. Ms. Molloy responded that she would talk with IT and the City Clerk to see what options were available for hybrid meetings. Vice Chair White is more comfortable meeting in the Council chambers as it is a larger space and would be a lower risk. He said he would like the option to meet virtually if the Council chambers were not available. Chair McCain also expressed a preference for the City Council chambers as it is easier to look at everyone while they are talking. Commissioner Chamberlain agreed, saying that the Council chambers are good for accessibility, consistency, and transparency.

Chair McCain asked when Phase 4 would come into effect. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that the City Council will be discussing this at their meeting on July 6<sup>th</sup>.

**G. Sustainability Section Update**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy gave an update on the Sustainability Section. Upcoming events include a Fix It Clinic on July 10<sup>th</sup> and a Watershed Clean Up Series on June 27<sup>th</sup>, July 8<sup>th</sup>, and July 29<sup>th</sup>. Staff is currently in the recruitment process for a Community Sustainability Specialist. Kaeli Wells has been hired on as the new Materials Management



Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Coordinator. The Climate Team has brought on 9 interns to help advance projects this summer. The Carbon Neutrality Plan was presented and adopted on June 15<sup>th</sup>. Staff has advanced conversations with Elevate Consulting Group to begin development of financial investment scenarios, financial impact assessments, and cost-avoidance estimates associated with the Carbon Neutrality Plan. The EV Charging Station project is moving forward with pre-construction meetings. The City of Flagstaff Sustainability Section and the Flagstaff Fire Department partnered to launch a new public health program called the Flagstaff HEPA Filter Program, which provides free HEPA air purifiers to at-risk community members. Staff selected a contractor to provide a weekly food scraps drop-off service at the Sunday farmer's market. Staff also completed a recycling audit of the Ponderosa Trails neighborhood that will serve as a baseline measure as the Pay-as-you-throw pilot begins in August. Staff hosted garden workshops in June. They are working on applying for the 2021 Urban Agriculture and Innovative Production grant for a Food Systems Assessment. Staff is also leading an NAU Public Health Capstone group to launch a food waste minimization campaign.

Commissioner Dailey asked for clarification on the Pay-as-you-throw project. Ms. Molloy answered that Staff is doing a pilot in the Ponderosa Trails neighborhood where residents can choose different sized bins with different rates.

Chair McCain asked how the Sustainability Section's interns might interact with the Commission. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that the interns could present at the end of their internship, or for more collaboration they could present in the July meeting on what projects they are working on. If there is any interest from the Commissioners on specific projects, Staff could connect the Commissioners with the interns to see what collaboration or support could be provided. She also mentioned that there could be opportunities for internships in the future to better include and incorporate the Commissioners.

**6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All**

Chair McCain and Commissioner Kauffman met with other judges to review submissions for the Climate Change and Hope bus placard project. The Commission will likely see what they funded in the future.

Commissioner Konkel said that the Adult Prom at the Orpheum would be fundraising for the Flagstaff Bike Party.

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

**7. Future Agenda Item Requests**

Commissioner Dailey proposed a discussion in the next meeting on advancing pedestrian and bike infrastructure in Flagstaff in response to a citizen petition to reallocate Prop 419 funding. He mentioned that he was one of the signature gatherers for the petition. He said it was important for the Sustainability Commission to make their views known to City Council. He would like a discussion on active transportation modes in Flagstaff and what the City can do to advance them.

Vice Chair White requested a discussion on Flagstaff's housing crisis. Ms. Antonopoulos said the 10-Year Housing Plan is currently being drafted. She said the intersection between housing and carbon neutrality is incredibly important in the work that Staff is doing and is discussed in the CNP. She said she is on the Sustainability Sub-Committee for the 10-Year Housing Plan and suggested waiting as the Housing team will be coming to the Commission for input when they have finished drafting the plan.

**8. Adjournment**

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on June 24, 2021 adjourned at 6:28 pm.

**CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at [www.flagstaff.az.gov](http://www.flagstaff.az.gov).

Dated this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2020.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison