

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

July 22, 2021

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held July 22nd, 2021, to order at 4:30 pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Kauffman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkell
<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Dailey

Others present: Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Jenny Niemann (Presenter), Kristin Pattenson (Presenter), Stefan Nelson (Presenter), Lori Matthews (Presenter), Silas Aiken (Presenter), Sheryl Wells (Presenter), Shelli Dea (Presenter), Jillian Goulet (Presenter), John Bedwell (Presenter), Sam Blustein (Presenter), Naomi Sanders (Presenter), Andrew Foss (Presenter), Bennett Rosenow (Presenter), Austin Aslan (Councilmember)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No Public Comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Konkell, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to approve the June 24th, 2021 minutes.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

5. **Business**

A. NSG Final Reports

NSG Recipients

Requested Action: Informational

Stefan Nelson presented on Killip Elementary 's Neighborhood Sustainability (Grant (NSG) project, Computer Restoration for Waste Mitigation and Community Resilience in the Sunnyside Neighborhood. This aimed to create a system to intake machines from the community and fix them up before sending them out to Killip families and the Flagstaff community. They also aimed to create a club to help with these devices and to educate students on computer engineering. They were able to use grant funds to purchase computer hardware and components, and families were supplied with computers. They delayed the club component due to Covid-19.

Kristin Pattenson presented on the Flagstaff Junior Academy's Climate Action Plan project. They partnered with the Climate Science and Solutions program at NAU. A portion of grant funds went towards a stipend for a graduate student to help write this plan, which would direct their efforts in becoming a more sustainable school and give them goals to work towards. Their plan was broken into categories of education, energy, transportation, water, and waste management. They also used funds to purchase science kits to start a more cohesive curriculum around climate. They budgeted for the transportation component and no idling signs for their pickup and drop off area but needed to adjust their strategy due to Covid-19.

Lori Matthews presented on ANEW Living's Community Garden & Chicken Coop project. Part of the project was to set up a greenhouse for year-round vegetables. They realized they needed to build a customized greenhouse to utilize the space better, which caused them to go overbudget but will be constructed in the next couple weeks. The rest of the funds went to building a new chicken coop, which was completed in August 2020 and gives the chickens and children collecting eggs much more space. Their garden was relocated and planted in June 2021. Additionally, they purchased a compost tumbler which will lead to richer soil and a reduction in waste.

Silas Aiken presented on his Greenlaw Garden Hub project. The goal was to create a spot in his neighborhood to give away food and starts, as well as to educate students on how to grow food and save water. He used grant funds to buy a rain cistern, rain gutters, and mulch. Because of the dry year, he fell short of his goal to grow 14 garden beds without using city water but is hoping to achieve this ambitious goal in the future. He was able to sell and give away garden starts. He gave away and sold over 40 bags of greens. He did not sell at the farmer's market last year because of Covid-19, but is hoping to be involved later this year when the

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

summer harvest comes in. He was not able to volunteer at schools or have students tour his garden because of Covid-19 but is still hoping to do this in the future.

Sheryl Wells presented on Killip Elementary's Garden Project. Their objectives were to expand and grow their garden program, increase the number of students participating, and increase food production for students and families. They developed new partnerships with the U of A Coconino County Cooperative Extension, Children in Nature Network, Terra BIRDS, AmeriCorps Vista, and the DLR Group and CORE Construction. Killip is under construction, but they are getting a 4,000 square foot garden put in with a greenhouse and other outdoor learning areas. Because of Covid-19, Students attended virtual gardening classes and then practiced what they learned with hydroponic systems, and seeds and supplies were sent home while they were completely remote. Grant funds were used to purchase seeds, tools, gloves, covers, and waterwalls.

Shelli Dea and Greg Caporaso presented on the Townsite Urban Farm project. Their goal was to work on infrastructure to help with sustainability on their farm and to educate Flagstaff on sustainable urban agriculture. The grant enabled them to install fans on a thermostat switch for their hoop house, a 4-bin compost system, and a new hügelkultur bed. They also built accessibility paths and improvements on their farm, added a crank system for raising and lowering the plastic on their hoop house to help increase its lifespan, and installed a solar system to run fans and other electronics. Covid-19 meant they could not host student tours, but as vaccines became more widely available, they hosted 40 members of the public for tours. Because of increased production on the farm, they were able to give a lot of food away to community members and nonprofits. They plan to continue to engage the community and nonprofits to provide food and hope to eventually connect with schools.

Chair McCain expressed gratitude for their work and flexibility during the pandemic. He mentioned the next grant cycle, saying that while they are not awarding funds to groups for two years consecutively, they should consider applying for the 2022-2023 cycle and share the opportunity with others. After no one expressed opposition to sharing contact information, he asked Ms. Molloy to email it out.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

B. Extension Letter for Grand Canyon Youth NSG Project

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Vote

Ms. Molloy presented a letter from Grand Canyon Youth requesting an extension for their NSG project. Covid-19 prevented them from finishing their project on time and they requested an extension through May 2022.

Vice Chair White said that given the circumstances of the last year, it would not be unreasonable to grant extensions. He said he would be in favor of granting all of the extensions.

Chair McCain asked if there were representatives to speak to the requests. Ms. Molloy answered that she had requested they come to speak only if they were able to attend and if the Commissioners had questions.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Konkol to provide an extension to Grand Canyon Youth as described in the letter.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

C. Extension Letter for Tynkertopia NSG Project

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Vote

Ms. Molloy presented a letter from Tynkertopia requesting an extension for their NSG project. Covid-19 and a relocation delayed their project. They are looking for a one-year extension so they can plant in the spring of 2022.

Chair McCain asked for clarification on the timeline. Dr. Alice Christie answered that they will be building the raised garden beds, getting the soil in, starting composting, and installing rain barrels and gutters this fall so they are ready to start planting in the spring of 2022.

Moved by Commissioner Konkol, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to grant the extension requested by Tynkertopia.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

D. Extension Letter for Radio Sunnyside NSG Project

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Vote

Ms. Molloy presented a letter from the Sunnyside Neighborhood Association, requesting an extension for their NSG project. Covid-19 delayed their project, and they are looking for an extension through December 2021.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the extension for Radio Sunnyside.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

E. Sustainability Intern Projects

Jillian Goulet, Climate Engagement Coordinator, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational

Jillian Goulet led Sustainability Interns in presentations on their current work. John Bedwell introduced himself as the Climate and Business intern. His objective is to work to build connections with local businesses to better understand their barriers, opportunities and current practices related to climate action. This will be done through interviews and meetings with local business leaders. Sam Blustein introduced himself as the Greenhouse Gas Inventory intern. His goal is to complete a city-wide greenhouse gas inventory using ClearPath, report the emissions to the CDP, update the main reporting and summary documents for the City to include this year's data, and research calculation methods for emission categories. He is also looking at natural sequestration to help balance the emission value. Naomi Sanders introduced herself as the Accessibility Intern. She is currently meeting with Sustainability Staff about accessibility within their programs, distributing relevant info, and making recommendations. Andrew Foss introduced himself as the Building Electrification intern. He is developing an electrification hub website to help educate residents and business owners. Bennett Rosenow introduced himself as the Transportation intern. He is conducting research in current infrastructure as it relates to other cities. He tests bike paths and will be proposing solutions to improve them, is working on a laymen friendly version of the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP), and is researching economic benefits to bike infrastructure improvements. Crystal Routh introduced herself as the Climate and Equity intern, and is focused on building relationships between the Sustainability Program and vulnerable communities. She is facilitating equity trainings for interns and incoming employees, collecting data on established community relationships with the Sustainability Program, and analyzing data to determine what relationships need to be established to ensure representation of all Flagstaff's

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

community groups in the CNP. Ms. Goulet presented for Jenna Decker, the Climate Equity Communications Intern, who working on peer city research in climate equity communications. She is looking at where these populations are and why these vulnerabilities exist. She will be collaborating with Sustainability Staff on an equity webpage and exploring culturally appropriate ways to communicate climate change and its effects with black, indigenous, and other people of color (BIPOC). Ms. Goulet also presented for Kylee Musslewhite, the RentLab intern. She is working on collecting utility data for rental properties and recruiting volunteers for future data collection. Once data is collected, it is compiled to create Smart Living Scores that rate rentals on how sustainable and cost effective they are. She is also contacting property managers to discuss sustainability initiatives and create awareness about Smart Living Scores and RentLab, especially among students through social media. Lastly, Ms. Goulet presented for Elijah Pinedo, Transportation intern. He is working to review the City of Flagstaff transportation documents and goals and is conducting research on peer cities for best practices.

Chair McCain asked if the websites that are being created would be through a central webpage or if they would be separate sites. Ms. Goulet answered that they are currently working with the City GIS team to develop a new carbon neutrality website where all of the intern's websites would go back to.

Chair McCain asked what strategies would be used to maintain relationships built after interns leave. Ms. Goulet answered that the interns are helping to form relationships and find outreach channels. She said one way to actively continue to engage these relationships is through advisory committees or groups.

Commissioner Konkel and Commissioner Dailey expressed gratitude for the interns' work.

F. Carbon Neutrality Plan and the Business Community

Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational and Discussion

Chair McCain gave a preface for the conversation by saying the intent was to take some time to explore the development and future of the CNP as it relates to the business community. He said there have been reports that elements of the business community have had concerns with the plan. He referred to a Daly Sun article reporting that the Chamber of Commerce shared a letter with Council stating 94% of their members were opposed to the plan. He said he is hopeful that continued outreach to the business community will allow those with concerns to feel heard going

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

forward, and wanted to discuss what role the Commission can play in addressing these concerns.

Jenny Niemann said that in the development of the CNP there were 2,600 people involved, six surveys, 11 online forums and open houses, and 72 presentations across Flagstaff. Many of those presentations were to the business community. She also noted that survey responses were mixed. Staff went through every concern with Council. She talked about the steering committee and how they relied on the Chamber of Commerce and ECONA to help communicate with community groups and businesses. Staff gave updates throughout the process and made several presentations to the Chamber and ECONA. She said that Staff heard confusion and concern about misinformation, how the housing emergency relates to the climate emergency, and the cost of climate action. Staff added 37 call out boxes to the CNP to help explain these topics. She also said Staff attended a Summit held by the chamber of Commerce in June, which was a review of climate work businesses are already doing. Staff wants to support businesses and is planning to form a business advisory committee or group. Intern interviews and relationships will be accompanied and followed up on by staff. As part of continuing engagement, Staff may do workshops, seminar series, or get coffee with businesses and could use the Commission's help with this. She said she would love to hear if the Commission has any other creative ideas.

Commissioner Dailey mentioned that he saw some of the poll text and was disappointed. He said he likes the idea of outreach on things that are both part of the CNP and tangible financial benefits to businesses in town.

Chair McCain expressed excitement for the interviews, and that it was a solid strategy to deal with specific individual concerns people have.

Vice Chair White asked if Staff would consider having an advisory group of employees and workers. Ms. Niemann noted that Staff is looking to create an equity advisory group which may cover some of the same ground, that Staff doesn't want to put businesses against employees, and that they could potentially have workers in the business advisory group. She said the point was well taken and Staff would consider it.

Commissioner Konkell noted that the list of businesses in the Chamber of Commerce isn't inclusive of all the businesses in Flagstaff, and that the poll percentage seems like a misleading number. She asked for clarification from Commissioner Dailey on his insight into the poll. Commissioner Dailey read one of the questions he saw from the poll. He agreed with Commissioner Konkell that other businesses might agree with the plan. Commissioner Konkell asked if another unbiased survey could be sent out to businesses. Ms. Niemann answered that Staff is collecting answers from a purely

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

informational survey right now, but that they were open to other ways of collecting information. She said if it was needed, staff would like to partner with ECONA to get information.

Vice Chair White noted that it would be good to pursue as many other avenues as possible for coordinating with other local businesses as well. Ms. Niemann answered that staff is trying to get to know the members of our business community better and build relationships.

Chair McCain shared discomfort about the poll. He expressed confidence in Staff's outreach efforts.

G. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Grading Exercise

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Discussion

Chair McCain led a discussion on the activity the Commissioners did to increase familiarity with the new scoring criteria and to address any questions the Commissioners had as they completed the activity. They reviewed the average scores the Commissioners gave during this activity.

Commissioner Konkel said that in the grant guidelines packet, it indicates that the best projects align with all three of the category and project objectives. She said that she believes that applicants need to meet all three objectives to get the maximum score and asked if the other Commissioners agreed. Chair McCain and Vice Chair White agreed. Chair McCain asked if it could be added to the evaluation form. Ms. Molloy agreed.

Commissioner Konkel asked how they should handle general overlap. She asked if there were different sections for each of the criteria in the new application. Ms. Molloy said if there were not that they could change it. Commissioner Konkel asked if it were acceptable for an applicant to copy and paste the same response into two sections or if that should affect the score. Chair McCain answered that would maybe affect the application completeness score if they aren't as clear or complete as they could be. Vice Chair White said he thought it was acceptable if the information being repeated is applicable to the different categories, but if applications were trying to skirt the question it should be reflected in the scores. Ms. Molloy presented the application questions in the grant guidelines and said that they didn't remove or reword questions in the application and that they could reword them to better fit the grading rubric. She edited the document so that "Project Sustainability" became "Project Longevity." Chair McCain asked if the Commission wanted to make any other changes. Commissioner

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Konkel suggested a bullet point asking if the project is innovative in any way. Ms. Molloy and the Commissioners added a bullet point application question in the grant guidelines document to read "Explain if and how the project is innovative by utilizing a new concept or technology." Chair McCain asked if we needed to vote on making these changes. Ms. Molloy said she believed they were minor enough that they did not but that she would check. She said if they did, they could vote on it in the next meeting.

H. Sustainability Section Update

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy gave an update on the Sustainability Section. Regional Plan info sessions are August 25th at 5:00 pm at the Murdoch Community Center and September 9th at 6:00 pm over Zoom. A Garden Workshop Series event will be held July 31st at 10:00 am at the O'Leary St. Garden and will focus on worm composting for kids. Flagstaff Climate Ambassador Training will be held August 10th and 11th, from 6:00 pm-7:30 pm over Zoom. The next Coffee and Climate will be Friday, August 27th. The last in the Summer Watershed Clean Up Series will be July 29th at 3:00 pm behind the Huntington Walmart. Staff is currently in the recruitment process for the Community Sustainability Specialist, whose applications close this Friday, July 23rd at 4:00pm, and a Climate Engagement Coordinator, whose applications close Friday, August 6th, at 4:00pm. The EV Charging site at the Aquaplex has begun construction. The Energy Rebate Program funding level was maintained at \$20,000, and the terms have been updated and refined. Appliance replacement rebates are now only available for eligible electric, biomass, and solar appliances. Many of the appliance rebates have been updated to match the Federal requirements for tax incentives and residents are encouraged to combine incentives for maximum impact. There is now a rebate bonus of up to \$100 for any appliance replacements that require an electrical panel or service upgrade. There is now an Income Qualified Rebate Supplement that offers between 10% and 15% additional rebate for households earning less than 125% of the area median income. Staff will be working with an NAU graduate class in the Climate Science and Solutions Program to create an Adaptation Addendum to the Carbon Neutrality Plan. There was an article in the AZ Daily Sun on climate change and how it can be related to the flooding we've seen in east Flagstaff. City Staff have initiated the process for the update to the climate change goals and policies of the Regional Plan and is now in the 60-day review period. After the 60-day review period, the amendment will be presented to the Planning and Zoning Commission in October and November, and then to the Flagstaff City Council in December. Staff selected a contractor to provide a weekly food scraps drop-off service at the Sunday farmer's market. Staff hosted a Fix It Clinic on July 10th at Joe C. Montoya Community and Senior Center. On July 8th, Staff

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

assisted with FUSD Summer Camp Recycling Education. The Pay as you Throw pilot is being rolled out in Ponderosa Trails. At the end of July, postcards and doorhangers will be distributed to Ponderosa Trails residents, and they will be able to sign up through email, phone, or an online form by Friday, August 13th. Staff is also working on applying for the 2021 Urban Agriculture and Innovative Production grant for a Food Systems Assessment.

Commissioner Dailey asked if Staff has considered doing something similar to the Solar CoOp Program with group purchases for water heaters or high efficiency wood stoves for the Energy Rebate Program to make for a cheaper value proposition for residents. Ms. Niemann said that group purchases can be an option. She said that the solar program was easy because there is already a nonprofit for that. This won't be as easy because there isn't a nonprofit for those items but it is something Staff is looking into.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

No to and from.

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

Vice Chair White asked if someone would speak soon on the 10-Year Housing Plan. Chair McCain and Ms. Molloy confirmed that they are working to schedule a presentation for next month's meeting. Chair McCain added that they were working to get a presentation on the Transportation Plan in the next meeting as well.

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on July 22, 2021 adjourned at 6:33 pm.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2020.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison