

# MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF  
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION  
THURSDAY**

**ONLINE MEETING  
MICROSOFT TEAMS  
4:30 – 6:30 PM**

**September 23, 2021**

## **1. Call to Order**

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held August 26th, 2021, to order at 4:34 pm.

## **2. Roll Call**

Chair McCain

Vice Chair White

Commissioner Konkol

Commissioner Dailey

Others present: Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Jenny Niemann (Presenter), Brianna Lovato (Presenter), Jenna Decker (Presenter), Martin Ince (Presenter), Summer White (Presenter), Kaeli Wells (Presenter), Nicole Antonopoulos (Staff), Austin Aslan (City Council Liaison)

## **3. Public Comment**

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address an item that is on the agenda, please use the Teams Chat function: simply type in 'public comment' to indicate to the Chair that you would like to comment. The Chair will then recognize you when it is time for public comment, and staff will unmute your microphone if needed.

No Public Comment

## **4. Approval of Minutes**

**Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Konkol to approve the August 26th, 2021 minutes.**

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

## **5. Business**

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

#### **A. NAU Climate Science and Solutions Resilience and Adaptation Document Introduction**

Jenny Niemann, Climate Program Manager, City of Flagstaff, and NAU Climate Science and Solutions Students

Requested Action: Informational

Jenny Niemann introduced the Climate Science and Solutions class. Brianna Lovato and Jenna Decker presented on their work. They are partnering with the City to work on adaptation recommendations to coincide with the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP). They went over a brief history of climate action in Flagstaff. Their goals are to expand adaptation methods outlined in the CNP, consolidate information provided in relevant City documents, facilitate conversations with the Flagstaff community and obtain their feedback, and provide recommendations to the City in a Resilience Resource Document. Their plan of action is to present to City Council, the Commission on Diversity Awareness, and the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living, as well as host a public forum to obtain feedback and recommendations, and to create a working Resilience Resource Document based on the community's input.

Chair McCain asked about the breadth of their recommendations and their scope of work. Ms. Decker answered that they are presenting to City Council, commissions, and community members to get feedback on what they should prioritize moving forward. Chair McCain asked if they are looking to get feedback from the forum or the current discussion. Ms. Decker responded that the purpose of this presentation, presentations to City Council and other commissions, and the public forum are to collect feedback. Chair McCain encouraged them to look at how the Flagstaff community can accept the shifting that will need to take place, including getting people to drive less. He also said it would be important to provide information to businesses showing them how to benefit from a proactive stance on climate. Commissioner Konkell said it was important to be culturally sensitive in the recommendations made and reach a diverse group of community members when seeking out these conversations.

Chair McCain asked the students what they were hoping to learn. Ms. Decker said she would like to learn how to improve forest health to avoid fires and flooding events and how to use forest management strategies to decrease the effects of these events. Dorcas Naa Aku Shika Quarshire responded they were hoping to limit waste that goes to the landfill to decrease emissions. John

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Fegyveresi, the faculty member leading this class, said he was excited about the concept of having this information more accessible to everyone. Chair McCain asked if there would be a website in addition to the forum. Mr. Fegyveresi answered that they plan to have a poll or survey to get feedback from those who cannot attend in person. They will also have a web portal on the City's website. Chair McCain encouraged them to go door to door for those with limited access to the internet. He also highlighted the neighborhood element of resiliency. Vice Chair White and Chair McCain offered additional assistance as needed.

Mr. Fegyveresi asked if there were any suggestions for the presentation before they go to City Council. Chair McCain suggested they make it more personal, noting he enjoyed hearing comments from the students. Commissioner Konkel suggested practicing the presentation a couple more times to make it more personal and conversational.

#### **B. Active Transportation Master Plan Discussion**

Martin Ince, Project Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Informational and Discussion

Martin Ince gave an update and more information about the Active Transportation Master Plan (ATMP). They released a draft of the document on their website, presented to City Council, and have opened the 60-day review period. A survey is open to the public. Different announcements and information for open houses and surveys to review the draft document are forthcoming. He encouraged the Commissioners to share the information. Mr. Ince then gave a review of the content and overall concepts of the plan draft. The ATMP is integrally linked with the CNP. More information on planning considerations and design guidance as well as pedestrian and bike infrastructure are forthcoming. They are tailoring pedestrian and bicycle projects with funding from the Transportation Sales Tax, and the City's Capital Improvements Program. The plan process includes a minor amendment to the Regional Plan. There will be detailed review and recommendation by the Pedestrian and Bike Advisory Committees, the Transportation Commission, the Planning and Zoning Commission, and City Council. The plan will likely go to Council for formal approval in March 2022. He said there has already been substantial community engagement and feedback, and they are checking in with the public to make sure the plan gets it right. Information on the plan and open houses can be found at [flagstaff.az.gov/atmp](http://flagstaff.az.gov/atmp).

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Vice Chair White said one of the big barriers to more active walking and biking in Flagstaff is weather as infrastructure is not in place to let people walk and bike in the snow. He asked if anything in the plan draft addressed that. Mr. Ince answered that there was nothing in the released draft that addressed that, but there are some details in documents that will be released later. He said the City can prioritize walking and biking routes for clearing snow. He also said other cities provide information on what to expect during snow events and which trails will be cleared off in the first few days. While this doesn't improve the level of service, it at least provides information. They hope to learn best practices from other communities in order to be as efficient as possible and provide a better level of service with resources available.

Commissioner Dailey asked for confirmation that the document was scheduled to go to Council for approval in March. Mr. Ince confirmed. Commissioner Dailey asked how that schedule would impact the City's ability to allocate funds and when they could start work. Mr. Ince responded that there was currently funding available from two sources, Prop 419 Transportation Sales Tax and the grant from Mountain Line. Staff is working on getting an agreement between the City and Mountain Line to start spending the money. He added they can have a Capital Plan before the ATMP is approved and that they are working on projects for next summer. He said programmatic items have not been specifically included in the Capital Plan or City's budget and would be a conversation once the ATMP is approved. Commissioner Dailey asked if the City needed to plan on starting to make capital outlays with the 419 funds on ATMP projects next year even if the ATMP isn't finalized. Mr. Ince confirmed, saying they have started working on sidewalks, FUTS trails, and other projects for next summer with the money that has been accruing.

Chair McCain asked if Rick Barrett was present. Mr. Ince said he was not. Chair McCain asked for a review of the timeline and Mr. Ince provided it.

Commissioner Dailey asked if the draft would return to the Sustainability Commission for an in-depth review and sign off like the one the Transportation Commission will be completing. Mr. Ince said it was not part of the process but that he could come back in an upcoming meeting to talk about the plan more in depth. Commissioner Dailey said that the mode switching and reduction of vehicle miles traveled in the ATMP are core building blocks of decarbonization in Flagstaff. He expressed concern that it could get watered down.

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

**C. Photo Contest**

Summer White, Sustainability Food Systems VISTA, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Vote

Summer White presented photos for the Garden Photo Contest. Scores and rankings were collected from the Commissioners and averaged before the meeting. She said the winner will receive a certificate to the Flagstaff Community Market.

**Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Vice Chair White to name Samantha Meier the winner of the Photo Contest and award them the certificate to the Flagstaff Community Market.**

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

**D. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Update**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy presented the current Neighborhood Sustainability Grant timeline. Applications will close on September 30<sup>th</sup>, on October 6<sup>th</sup> applications will be sent to the Commissioners, and on October 15<sup>th</sup> those scores will be due. On October 19<sup>th</sup> the working group will meet to determine which applicants will present, on October 20<sup>th</sup> the top applications will be sent to all Commissioners, and on October 25<sup>th</sup> those scores will be due. Presentations will take place in the October and November meetings, with the final scoring taking place in the November meeting. Funding will be dispersed in December. She also presented on the Grant Workshop that took place on September 18<sup>th</sup> and asked the Commissioners to help spread the word.

Chair McCain asked how many applications had been received so far. Ms. Molloy answered that there were no applications in, but said she was not concerned because the deadline was still a week out and she has had conversations with several people about their applications.

**E. Killip Elementary School Garden Letter for Use of Leftover Grant Funds**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Vote

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Marissa Molloy presented a letter from Killip Elementary requesting approval for an updated budget for their remaining Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Funds.

**Moved by Commissioner Konkell, seconded by Chair McCain to approve the spending as proposed in their letter.**

Chair McCain asked what delayed the project. Ms. Molloy answered that Covid and remote learning delayed their project.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

**F. Terra BIRDS Letter for Use of Leftover Grant Funds**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Vote

Marissa Molloy presented a letter from Terra BIRDS requesting approval for an updated budget for their remaining Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Funds.

Chair McCain asked what would happen to the funds if they were returned. Nicole Antonopoulos answered that the money would be returned to the Sustainability office's fund balance and then could be reappropriated next year into the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant fund.

**Moved by Commissioner Dailey, seconded by Commissioner Konkell to approve the funding extension as requested in their letter.**

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

**G. Consider Topics for Future Climate Crisis-related Projects in Collaboration with the Beautification and Public Art Commission**

David McCain, Commission Chair  
Requested Action: Discussion

Chair McCain reviewed a memo sent out to the Commissioners about future projects with the Beautification and Public Art Commission (BPAC). BPAC would like to continue steering some funds towards climate crisis-related projects. He then invited Commissioners to comment on project ideas provided or propose additional project ideas.

## Minutes

### City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner Konkell expressed concern about safety issues around beautifying bike lanes and wondered if there was safety data to make sure they were not putting bicyclists at risk. Ms. Antonopoulos added that federal regulations may not allow for a project like this. Commissioner Dailey expressed similar concerns, adding that non-motorized transportation is already beautiful. Vice Chair White agreed that safety had to be the top priority with bike lanes.

Vice Chair White said that with environmental issues there are a lot of broad statements but less concrete information. He gave the example of the level of water in Flagstaff's aquifers and the costs to the City if the aquifers are depleted. He said it would be beneficial to communicate specific and local information people need to know. He also said it is better to address despair in children by putting things directly into action. While Flagstaff has seen positive steps, there are still reasons to be cynical if there haven't been concrete actions that have come to fruition yet. He said they could consider something similar to the graduate students that are going to be consulting with the commissions and City Council, but with high schoolers or elementary schoolers. He said if hope isn't accompanied by concrete actions it can turn into cynicism.

Chair McCain noted that one of the challenges of the commission structure is that they are siloed into different areas. Even though the climate crisis is an all-sides approach, it is hard for the commissions to all work on it. He said art has a focus separate from specific action and is about a message or broad theme. He highlighted the big shift and said he would be excited about something that takes on the transformation vs incrementalism difference from the ATMP. He said a project could conceive the transformational lifestyle shifts needed and what it means to be a citizen that is a steward of future generations. He said it would be good if a BPAC project could engage students at different levels and ages, including the graduate level like the Climate Science and Solutions class, to generate their own art around these topics and to tap into the creativity of different groups instead of prescribing something.

Commissioner Konkell said one of the key components of making a city more pedestrian friendly is making areas where people are walking and biking beautiful. She said there could be spaces in Flagstaff's downtown alleys where walking was encouraged. This could include the great murals all over downtown and could claim a space in an alleyway where instead of cars there were bistro

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

lights, tables, and murals featuring climate action related art projects.

Commissioner Dailey agreed that there was a general poor understanding of information and where emissions come from, and that there was room for more in-depth education. He also agreed that art should be art.

Vice Chair White suggested art that envisioned other ways the world could be. He said they could have a book club and read different authors with different visions on what a sustainable community could look like, and art could be based on that. He said there are ways to present information and ideas in an artistic way and is something the community badly needs.

Chair McCain said it would be great to inform homeowners or potential buyers on ways to make their home more efficient. His idea was to have a model home as an art piece. It could be an older home people can tour through with a guide to explain the retrofits. The house could incorporate artistic features.

Chair McCain said he hoped the Commission could have conversations like this in future meetings. He said he would forward the information and have BPAC get back to them after their budget meeting.

**H. Community Sustainability Specialist Introduction and Pay As You Throw Update**

Kaeli Wells, Community Sustainability Specialist, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Informational

Kaeli Wells introduced herself as the Community Sustainability Specialist. She has previously worked with the Sustainability Office as an AmeriCorps VISTA member for Open Space and as a contractor on projects like the HEPA Filter Program. She then gave an update on the Pay As You Throw Pilot. They targeted the Ponderosa Trails neighborhood because it is a middle-income neighborhood with an HOA, which makes it easy to reach out to residents. The original trash bins for this neighborhood are 96-gallons. Residents were offered a 64-gallon bin with \$2.21 savings per month or a 48-gallon bin with \$4.19 savings per month. The six-month pilot started in August. Those who signed up at the beginning received a full rebate. Those who signed up afterwards got a partial rebate. Staff was unable to do their usual methods of mass outreach via social media, so instead they used postcards, doorhangers, an HOA mass email, and a website. To measure the possibility of more recycling contamination due



Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

to a smaller trash cart, Staff and volunteers are doing recycling audits. To see if trash is redirected to bulky pickup, Staff is measuring the bulky pickup tonnage collected during this pilot. The University Heights neighborhood is acting to represent Flagstaff in comparison to Ponderosa Trails. Ms. Wells is completing recycling bin checks every Monday, and leaves tags on bins to let residents know if they are doing well or need to improve. From the recycling audits, Ponderosa Trails is showing 19% contamination rate and University Heights is at 26% contamination. The initial recycling audits at the MRF took place in June and July. August 13<sup>th</sup> was the last day to register for a full rebate, and on August 30<sup>th</sup> recycling bin checks began. Recycling audits take place every two months. The pilot will end on Feb 28<sup>th</sup>.

Commissioner Konkell asked if the same pricing is being considered if the program goes City wide, or if the price of full-size trash would increase to motivate people to size down. Ms. Wells said that would be a conversation they would need to have with Todd Hanson to figure out what pricing would look like when it is available to all of Flagstaff.

Chair McCain asked when there would be a report on the findings and what the next steps to expand the pilot would be. Ms. Wells answered that she hopes to have a report on the findings and how to improve the program in the spring. She said the next steps would be to propose the program to City Council. Chair McCain asked if residents would keep the smaller trash carts. Ms. Wells answered that at the end of the six months they will be swapping the trash carts back out with the full-sized ones. She said that the smaller carts would hopefully be used when the program is offered City wide.

**I. November and December Meeting Dates**

David McCain, Commission Chair

Requested Action: Vote

Chair McCain led a discussion on the dates of the November and December Commission meetings. The fourth Thursday of each month falls on a holiday, so the Sustainability Commission voted on different dates to meet.

Chair McCain asked about the consideration of the November date for the Climate Science Solutions Class. Ms. Molloy answered that the class would be presenting to Council again in late November. She said if the Commission met on November 18<sup>th</sup>, they could use that meeting as a practice run before going

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

to Council. Chair McCain asked if the October meeting was the week before the potential November 4<sup>th</sup> meeting date. Ms. Molloy confirmed.

**Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to hold the November Sustainability Commission Meeting on November 18<sup>th</sup>.**

Commissioner Konkell asked if they would be getting any more Commission members to help alleviate concern about meeting quorum in the holiday months. Ms. Molloy and Ms. Antonopoulos answered that the City Clerk would ideally like to see one more application before it goes to Council, but they are currently scheduled for October 19<sup>th</sup>. Chair McCain asked if new Commissioners would be able to join for the October meeting. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that they could if their schedule allowed.

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

Commissioner Konkell noted that she would be unable to meet for the first half of the December 2<sup>nd</sup> date. Chair McCain asked how many vacancies the Council would fill on the 19<sup>th</sup> of October. Ms. Molloy said she believed it was all three vacancies.

**Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Konkell to hold the December Sustainability Commission Meeting on December 9<sup>th</sup>.**

Vote: 4-0 Unanimously passed

**J. Sustainability Section Update**

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff  
Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy gave an update on the Sustainability Section. Upcoming events include Make a Difference Day, the Flagstaff 15 Minute Makeover on October 15<sup>th</sup>, Drop Off Day on October 23<sup>rd</sup>, and Garden Workshops on September 25<sup>th</sup> and October 9<sup>th</sup>. The recruitment process is currently underway for the Climate Engagement Coordinator, Volunteer and Event Coordinator, and Waste Reduction & Food Systems Coordinator positions. Four new EV Charging Stalls at the Aquaplex are up and running. Staff presented their first quarterly update on the CNP to Council, are working on an internal electrification policy, supporting the development of the 10-year Housing Plan, and supporting the

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

engagement process for the ATMP. The CNP webpage is active. The Regional Plan Amendment 60-day review period has closed and is moving to review with the Planning and Zoning Commission. Staff hosted their second quarterly litter abatement meeting. Registration for the Sustainability Leaders course has closed, and classes begin on September 30<sup>th</sup>. Staff are sponsoring an NAU public health capstone cohort, focusing on behavior change through a waste minimization lens. The Residential Food Scraps Drop Off is underway and will shift to a self-service drop off at a different location on October 17<sup>th</sup>. In October, there will be working sessions at the Community Compost Hubs to better guide participants on the first three Wednesdays of the month. Terra BIRDS is hosting volunteer work days at the Izabel and O'Leary St. gardens on the next two Thursdays and Saturdays.

Chair McCain asked when the Staff update to Council on the CNP took place. Ms. Molloy said she believed it was in the past week.

**6. To and From**

No To and From.

**7. Future Agenda Item Requests**

Vice Chair White asked to discuss the current housing crisis and future housing plans from a sustainability perspective. He also asked to discuss the broader water issues and what they represent. He mentioned that the Taala Hooghan Infoshop was given a \$10,000 water bill. He said money dealing with this bill could potentially otherwise feed people who need the help. He said this is an example of efforts to deal with climate change, potential water shortages, and Flagstaff water policy impacting vulnerable people most adversely. Chair McCain asked for an update on the Housing presentations. Ms. Molloy answered that Housing Staff are presenting the 10-year Housing Plan to Council next week. She said because they had so much interest, they are going to do one large meetings to all the commissions. A date has yet to be announced. She added that she spoke to the Housing Commission liaison, and Staff is hoping to have a joint meeting and present to both the Housing and Sustainability Commissions sometime in 2022 to discuss the housing crisis and how housing and sustainability corelate.

Commissioner Konkell said Mayor Deasy gave a presentation about a new solar challenge that sounded similar to the co-op that Flagstaff facilitated in the spring.

Minutes  
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

She said the Commission was consulted about the previous co-op and asked if that would be a similar process with this new challenge from the Mayor. Ms. Molloy said she would look into it.

**8. Adjournment**

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on September 23rd, 2021 adjourned at 6:43 pm.

**CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at [www.flagstaff.az.gov](http://www.flagstaff.az.gov).

Dated this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2020.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison